Examining preceptors’ professionalism from a student perspective

Binbin Zheng, PhD; Steven Roskos, MD; Margaret Thompson, MD; Henry Barry, MD

Michigan State University
March 23, The CGEA Conference 2018
We have no conflicts of interest
Teaching professionalism is essential for medical education.

Role modeling is the method most frequently used to teach about professionalism.
• Students reported concerns of faculty’s lapse in professionalism
• “the hidden curriculum” of adverse faculty mentoring of unprofessional behavior
• Research question
  – How do students in their clerkship program evaluate preceptors’ professionalism?
Method

- MSU IRB exempt approval
- Clerkship program during 2016-17 school year
  - 380 third and fourth year medical students
  - 1,613 preceptors across eight campuses and seven specialties
Faculty Professionalism Evaluation

Please rate the overall professionalism of your clinical educator below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Below Expectations</th>
<th>Met Expectations</th>
<th>Exceeded Expectations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meets some of the professionalism competencies but performed at a lower level</td>
<td>Meets all of the professionalism competencies</td>
<td>Exceeds professionalism expectations; demonstrated meritorious performance significantly above the average faculty member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>than expected overall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image" alt="Circle 1" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Circle 2" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Circle 3" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Professionalism Comments**

Please comment on the clinical educator’s professionalism based on your interactions with them.
A total of 8,785 observations, among them 3,311 comments were left.

Mixed methods
- Ratings: ANOVA statistical analysis
- Comments: Thematic analysis
Virtuous Professional

Three core CHM Virtues

Honesty
Compassion
Social Responsibility

Competence
Reflection
Dialogue

Professional Responsibility
Respect for Others

Process for Professional Growth

Six professional responsibilities
Preceptor status

- Resident Educator: 39%
- Faculty Educator: 59%
- Non-physician Educator: 2%
- Clerkship Director: 0%
Clerkship specialties

- Family Medicine: 14%
- Internal Medicine: 21%
- Advanced Medicine: 10%
- Ob/Gyn: 15%
- Pediatrics: 20%
- Surgery: 14%
- Psychiatry: 6%
- Internal Medicine: 21%
- Advanced Medicine: 10%
- Ob/Gyn: 15%
Results: Ratings

No significant differences were detected across specialties or educator types.
### Results: Positive keywords

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compassion</td>
<td>Encouraging; patient; caring; willing to help; care about students; compassionate; empathy; thoughtful; supportive; understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>Knowledgeable; thorough; efficient; intelligent; communication skills; competent; insightful; proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect for others</td>
<td>Respectful; rapport; approachable; bedside manner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Responsibility</td>
<td>Time; feedback; involving; answer questions; inclusive; willing to teach; engaging; autonomy; enthusiastic; hands-on experience; passionate; leadership; challenge students to think; dedicated; open to teaching; inspiring; committed; conscientious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Responsibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Results: Positive keywords

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Compassion</strong></td>
<td>Encouraging; patient; caring; willing to help; care about students; compassionate; empathy; thoughtful; supportive; understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Competence</strong></td>
<td>Knowledgeable; thorough; efficient; intelligent; communication skills; competent; insightful; proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Honesty</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Respect for others</strong></td>
<td>Respectful; rapport; approachable; bedside manner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Professional Responsibility</strong></td>
<td>Time; feedback; involving; answer questions; inclusive; willing to teach; engaging; autonomy; enthusiastic; hands-on experience; passionate; leadership; challenge students to think; dedicated; open to teaching; inspiring; committed; conscientious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Responsibility</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results: Positive keywords

- teach
- autonomy
- answer
- involving
- caring
- knowledgeable
- questions
- patient
- approachable
- encouraging
- respectful
- time
- open
- enthusiasm
- hands-on
- efficiency
- students
- engaging
- feedback
- inclusive
Comments rated as “3”s

- Involving: 29%
- Encouraging: 17%
- Rapport: 17%
- Feedback: 17%
- Knowledgeable: 20%
Dr. V kept the medical students involved with the care of his patients and made us feel as though we were an important and needed part of the team.
Encouraging

Dr. M encourages everyone else on the team to work hard and to do it well. Truly cares about team work and making everyone feel part of the team.
He takes extra time to develop patient rapport.
Dr. R taught me the most about suturing, and provided me with great feedback.
it is clear that Dr. D is extremely knowledgeable, skillfully trained, and puts his patients first 100% of the time
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compassion</td>
<td>Uncompassionate; careless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>Incompetent; defensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td>Forcing workload on interns; unethical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect for others</td>
<td>Condescending; hostile; irritated; derogatory; offensive; disrespect; rude; mean; inappropriate comments about patients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Responsibility</td>
<td>Vague in expectations; unreceptive to feedback; uninvolving</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Responsibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Results: negative keywords

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Compassion</td>
<td>Uncompassionate; careless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competence</td>
<td>Incompetent; defensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td>Forcing workload on interns; unethical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Respect for others</strong></td>
<td><strong>Condescending; hostile; irritated; derogatory; offensive; disrespectful; rude; mean; inappropriate comments about patients</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Responsibility</td>
<td>Vague in expectations; unreceptive to feedback; uninvolved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Responsibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Feedback from students could help preceptors reflect on their own professionalism
• Provide examples of best practices in professionalism (role modeling)
• Unprofessional behavior to avoid
Limitations and future directions

• Limitations
  – Rating scale
  – Evaluation time point
  – Completely exploratory, not generalizable

• Future directions
  – Rating on the six attributes
  – Compare preceptor-on-student and student-on-preceptor feedback
  – Gender differences


The Virtuous Professional: A system of professional development for students, residents and faculty. Retrieved from http://humanmedicine.msu.edu/Medical_Education/Assets/The-Virtuous-Professional.pdf
Questions?