

OCTOBER
2018



2017–18 Preliminary Report on the

CALIFORNIA ADULT EDUCATION PROGRAM

California Department of Education
Tom Torlakson, State Superintendent of Public Instruction

California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office
Eloy Ortiz Oakley, Chancellor



**CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY
COLLEGES
CHANCELLOR'S OFFICE**

1430 N Street, Sacramento, CA 95814
916-319-0800

1102 Q Street, Sacramento, CA 95811
916-445-8752

January 28, 2019

The Honorable Gavin Newsom
Governor of California

Keely Bosler
Department of Finance

Karen Stapf Walters
State Board of Education

Diane F. Boyer-Vine
Legislative Counsel

Erika Contreras
Secretary of the
Senate

E. Dotson Wilson
Chief Clerk of the
Assembly

Subject: *California Adult Education Program Report*

The California Community Colleges Chancellor and the State Superintendent of Public Instruction are pleased to present the *California Adult Education Program (CAEP)* preliminary report established in Assembly Bill 104 (Chapter 13, Statutes of 2015) and amended by Assembly Bill 1602 (Chapter 24, Statutes of 2016).

On or before October 30, 2018, California *Education Code* Section 84917 tasks the two agencies with providing to the Director of Finance, the State Board of Education, and the Legislature a preliminary report about the use of adult education funds and outcomes for adults statewide and in each adult education region. The final report on the uses and outcomes of these funds is due on or before February 1, 2019.

This report, based on all data available at the time, addresses all of the following: a summary of consortia annual plans funded under the CAEP, the consortia distribution schedule, the effectiveness of consortia, and the types and levels of services.

If you have any questions regarding this report, please contact Vice Chancellor of Governmental Relations Laura Metune, California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, by phone at 916-323-5951 or by email at lmetulan@cccco.edu or Khieem Jackson, Director, Government Affairs Division, California Department of Education, by phone at 916-319-0821 or by email at kjackson@cde.ca.gov.

Thank you for your continued support and commitment to California's adult learners.

Sincerely,

Tony Thurmond
State Superintendent of Public Instruction
California Department of Education

Eloy Ortiz Oakley
Chancellor
California Community Colleges

TT/EO:c
Enclosure

January 28, 2019

Page 2

cc: Jennifer Johnson, Deputy Legislative Secretary, Office of the Governor
Jeff Bell, Program Budget Manager, Department of Finance
Gabriel Petek, Legislative Analyst, Legislative Analyst's Office
Jennifer Kuhn, Deputy Legislative Analyst, Education, Legislative Analyst's Office
Bill Riddle, Senior Librarian, Government Publications, California State Library

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	1
California Adult Education Program Key Accomplishments in 2017–18	2
Summary of Consortia Annual and Three-Year Plans	4
Effectiveness of Consortia/Types and Levels of Services	5
Recommendations	8
Appendix A: Consortia Funding Distribution Schedule	9

Executive Summary

The California Legislature implemented the California Adult Education Program (CAEP), which created a regional delivery system to provide education and workforce services to adult learners. To ensure that funding accelerates adults into employment, living wages, and full engagement in society, the legislation requires that the Chancellor of the California Community Colleges (Chancellor) and the State Superintendent of Public Instruction (SSPI) submit to the Legislature, as provided in California *Education Code* Section 84917, two reports: (1) a preliminary report on or before October 30 following each fiscal year for which funds are appropriated for the program, and (2) a final report on or before February 1 of the following year. These reports are to be based on data available at the time of their submission and should include at least the following information:

- A summary of the adult education plan operative for each consortium
- The distribution schedule for each consortium
- The types and levels of services provided by each consortium
- The effectiveness of each consortium in meeting the educational needs of adults in its respective region
- Any recommendations related to delivery of education and workforce services for adults, including recommendations related to improved alignment of state programs

In 2017–18, the Chancellor and SSPI submitted preliminary and end-of-year reports to the Legislature using the metrics and accountability framework described in the August 2017 *Measuring Our Success (MOS)* report to the Legislature. The *MOS* report defined key data metrics, program definitions, data collection instruments, data sharing across state agencies, and plans for interagency alignment of student assessment practices and reporting.

This report will address the key requirements of the legislation, as identified above, focusing on the following in the evolution of California’s adult education system:

- Key accomplishments for the CAEP for 2017–18
- A recap of consortia annual plans and three-year planning processes in preparation for the submission of the next cycle of CAEP three-year plans in June 2019
- Progress on the implementation of data collection processes and architecture as described in the *MOS* report
- Preliminary enrollment data from CAEP consortia for the 2017–18 program year

California Adult Education Program Key Accomplishments in 2017–18

The California Adult Education Program (CAEP) continues to build the infrastructure to support the statewide implementation of regional consortia. This included progress related to practitioner effectiveness, data and accountability, and interagency alignment.

Practitioner Effectiveness

- **Adult Education Field Teams:** The CAEP expanded the adult education field team process to six teams that included over 60 practitioners charged with making recommendations to the CAEP Office for improvements in adult education. These teams include Data and Accountability, Regional Collaboration, Career Pathways, Member Effectiveness, Professional Development, and Crosswalk teams working on alignment of basic skills between community college basic skills descriptors and the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA), Title II Educational Functioning Levels.
- **Training and Technical Assistance:** The CAEP increased the provision of professional development and technical assistance to the field. In 2017–18, the CAEP Technical Assistance Provider (TAP) facilitated responses from professional development partners for 12,313 technical assistance requests, hosted 72 statewide webinars for 3,871 attendees, and facilitated 87 in-person workshops for 2,650 attendees. Technical assistance requests include requirement clarification, completion of documentation, and data reporting. Evaluation scores by over 2,000 attendees rated the professional development received as good or excellent at a 93 percent or higher level, on a scale of 0–100.

Data and Accountability

- **NOVA Implementation:** In 2017–18, the CAEP fully implemented the NOVA financial and accountability system. As of 2018–19, consortia will submit their three-year plans, annual plan updates, and financial reporting through NOVA. NOVA will also connect the consortium financial reporting to key member strategies and data points pulled through the CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline. Of the 450 consortia members participating in regional consortium decision-making, 390 member agencies who receive CAEP funding are using NOVA for reporting their budgets, expenses, and annual plan updates. All members use NOVA for consortium decision-making. However, due to consortia decisions on funding model, fiscal agent versus direct funding, not all members use NOVA for budgeting, expense reporting, and work plans.
- **Adult Education Data Pipeline:** In 2018, the CAEP implemented the CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline. Housed in the same system that displays data for community colleges, the Strong Workforce Program, and California Guided

Pathways, the CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline displays key metrics documenting enrollment, student progress, transition to postsecondary education, student completion, and employment outcomes for every CAEP consortium in the state. The platform supports member, consortium, regional, and state level data views and disaggregation by gender, age, race/ethnicity, and special populations. Consortia are expected to use their CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline data for the development of their three-year plans in 2018–19.

Interagency Collaboration

The California Department of Education (CDE) and the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) worked closely with other California state agencies to increase the alignment of services and data metrics for adult learners in California. These included:

- **Co-enrollment:** The CDE and the CCCCCO worked with the State of California Labor and Workforce Development Agency (State Labor Agency), CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline, the Economic Development Department, the California Workforce Development Board, and other state agencies on the development of guidance for strategic co-enrollment of adult learners in all four Titles of WIOA (Titles I, II, III, IV), California Work Opportunity and Responsibility to Kids (CalWORKs), adult education, and other programs. This included alignment of key metrics, priority populations, and enrollment processes to support the efforts of local agencies to leverage resources and services for the most vulnerable adult populations. California was one of seven states in the nation selected to participate in this national pilot by the United States Department of Labor and United States Department of Education.
- **English Language Navigator Pilots:** The CDE, the CCCCCO, the State Labor Agency, and the California Workforce Development Board are also collaborating on the implementation of California's English Language (EL) Navigator pilot grants. EL Navigator funded five local workforce development boards, their adult education partners, and community-based organizations to identify best practices to better serve the EL learner and immigrant population in the workforce system. The passage of Assembly Bill 2098 in 2018 will strengthen the importance of immigrant integration in the CAEP¹. The CDE and the CCCCCO will collaborate with the Director of Immigrant Integration and stakeholders to develop the metrics for CAEP consortia and members to use to measure effective immigrant integration.
- **CalWORKs Outcomes and Accountability Review:** The CDE and the CCCCCO are also collaborating with the Department of Social Services in the planning for the CalWORKs Outcomes and Accountability Review data and accountability framework for CalWORKs. This collaboration has included participation in the

¹ https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billTextClient.xhtml?bill_id=201720180AB2098

development of key accountability measures, sharing of key metrics and data points from the CDE and the CCCCCO, and planning for data sharing between the agencies.

Summary of Consortia Annual and Three-Year Plans

The CAEP consortia submitted final annual updates to their current three-year plans in June 2018, which included incremental updates on activities from previous years. However, most consortia are currently putting most of their effort into their new three-year plans due in June 2019. This portion of the report will present current activity in preparation for the three-year planning process and how the CAEP is scaffolding technical assistance to support that undertaking. The end-of-year report will provide a summary of the 2017–18 annual plan updates and the alignment between those submissions to set the stage for the arrival of the consortia three-year plans in June 2019.

To support the three-year planning process, the CAEP Office has prepared planning guidance that identifies four key stages for effective planning and scaffolds technical assistance that can assist the consortia through each stage of the planning process.

- **Pre-Planning Assessment:** Evaluation of the consortium’s capacity, identifying the consortium’s key partners and alignment with other regional planning processes
- **Community Need and Customers:** Understanding the needs of the community, the current customers, and regional labor market opportunities
- **Identifying Goals and Strategies:** How and where the consortium will improve programs and services and the strategies, activities, and expected outputs to get there
- **Piloting and Implementation:** How the consortium will pilot new strategies, evaluate them, and scale them for full implementation

The CAEP Office and the Sacramento County Office of Education Technical Assistance Project (SCOE TAP) have scheduled regional and state level trainings for practitioners to support each stage of the planning process, including:

- **Webinars** on the use of NOVA for plan submission, data-driven decision-making, effective adult education teaching strategies, effective self-assessment, and other topics. Webinars typically occur weekly and sometimes more often as topics emerge.
- **Online training resources** including virtual Human Centered Design (HCD) training through a partnership with American Institutes of Research (AIR), WestEd, and Acumen and online training on the use of Comprehensive Adult Student Assessment Systems (CASAS) tools.

- **Regional professional development events** in the fall and spring. In fall 2018, the CAEP Office collaborated with WestEd to offer workshops on data tools for effective planning, including the use of customer and community needs data, labor market information, and the CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline and HCD effective pathway design and implementation.
- **Targeted technical assistance** to the field offered by SCOE TAP, AIR, the Outreach and Technical Assistance Network, CASAS, and WestEd.

Effectiveness of Consortia/Types and Levels of Services

This report frames the comprehensive enrollment and outcome data that will be available in the February 1, 2019, report to the Legislature. That report will include comprehensive data on student enrollment, progress, and outcomes using the CAEP MOS report indicators. The report will have other metrics, which include:

- Total adults served and participants
- Skills gains for Adult Basic Education (ABE), Adult Secondary Education (ASE), and English as a Second Language (ESL) students
- Transition ABE or ESL to ASE programs
- Completion of diploma or High School Equivalency
- Completion of college credit awards
- Enrollment by program area
- Occupation and workforce prep skills gains
- Transition to postsecondary education
- Completion of postsecondary credentials
- Employment and wage gains

The first year of comprehensive student-level data collection for the CAEP was 2016–17. Many metrics require more than one year of data to calculate, and due to this, these data points were not reported to the Legislature for the 2016–17 end-of-year report. These include the transition to ASE from ABE or ESL, transition to postsecondary education, completion of postsecondary credentials after exiting adult education, and employment and earnings data. 2017–18 will provide a second year of comparative data and will allow for the calculation of transition, postsecondary completion, and employment data. The 2017–18 end-of-year report will provide a much more comprehensive picture of student progress and outcomes.

Progress Building the California Adult Education Program's Data and Accountability System

The first full year of student-level data collection in the CAEP was 2017–18. In 2016–17, CASAS TOPSpro Enterprise® was introduced mid-year to begin collecting data from kindergarten through grade twelve (K–12), adult schools, and community college noncredit programs. Consequentially, there were challenges regarding initial data collection including that many of the CAEP metrics, program definitions, and population definitions were not yet well understood, and colleges in particular had to adapt to the use of CASAS TOPSpro Enterprise®.

In 2017–18, the CAEP Office and CASAS provided extensive technical assistance to the field in regional trainings to better implement the new tools and answer questions about the metrics, program, and student type definitions in the *MOS* report released in August 2017. The increasing familiarity with both the data collection tools and with the metrics and definitions will contribute to a much more robust data set in 2017–18.

In 2017–18, the CAEP began building a data visualization tool to allow the adult education consortia members to access their data for planning and measuring effectiveness. This tool was built as an additional CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline, a data platform used by the CCCCO and by college practitioners for looking at program enrollment and outcome data related to different system initiatives. The tab went live in August 2018 and is currently being tested by the field. It will serve as the centerpiece of regional data field training in October 2018.

Adult Education Preliminary 2017–18 Enrollment Data

CAEP Member Agency Reporting: In 2017–18, 378 CAEP consortia members submitted data through CASAS TOPSpro Enterprise®. This included 64 community colleges, 259 K–12 adult schools, 25 County Offices of Education (COEs), 4 Regional Occupational Programs (ROPs), 1 library, 1 workforce development board, 22 jail programs (15 from K–12 adult, 4 from community colleges, and 3 from COEs).

Overall Participation in Adult Education: According to 2017–18 data submitted by consortia members, approximately 769,901 unduplicated individuals were served by adult education consortia members. Based on initial counts, 74,739 more adults were served by CAEP consortia in 2017–18 than in 2016–17. CAEP **Adults served** is an unduplicated count of adults that received one or more hours of instruction or received services at a K–12 adult school or college noncredit program. Students are included in this count who received services regardless of enrollment in an CAEP. **Participants** are students who enrolled into an CAEP (ESL, ABE, ASE, Career and Technical Education [CTE], etc.) and who received at least 12 hours of instruction. Those 12 hours are calculated across the program year and do not have to be within a single program.

CAEP Enrollment: Approximately 971,776 adults were enrolled into adult education programs in 2017–18. This was an increase of 119,963 from the prior year student enrollment. Enrollment in each program includes adults enrolled in the program

regardless of the number of hours completed or who may have enrolled in other programs at the same time or at other times during the program year. As the count would indicate, many students participate in adult education programs; however, many do not get 12 hours of total instruction and may be enrolled into other programs during the program year, indicating the fluidity of adult education enrollment and the open entry/open exit nature of adult education classes, particularly for students with lower levels of EL proficiency, literacy, or numeracy skills.

**California Adult Education Program Duplicated Enrollment by Program
2017–18**

	ABE	ASE	ESL	CTE²	AWD³	CSS⁴	WE/R⁴	UNK⁴	Totals
K–12 Adult	46,436	137,326	196,286	90,315	5,586	9,427	63,060	48,430	596,866
College	51,151	33,857	115,890	36,353	5,717	3,567	35,156	73,240	354,931
Other*	6,235	4,865	916	3,366	2	75	3,024	1,496	19,979
Totals	103,822	176,048	313,092	130,034	11,305	13,069	101,240	123,166	971,776 ⁵

The enrollment reported above represents preliminary findings from the data sets which are currently being analyzed for inclusion in the end-of-year report to the Legislature and for incorporation into the second build of the CAEP LaunchBoard Data Pipeline in January 2019.

Enrollment continues to be very low in three program areas, AWD, CSS, and Preapprenticeship, which together accounted for only 4 percent of adults served in 2017–18. Preapprenticeship enrollment was particularly low, with only 2,464 adult participants in 2017–18. The 2019 end-of-year report to the Legislature will contain more nuanced findings regarding enrollment, persistence, transition, completion, employment, and other outcomes. It will include a more in-depth discussion about programs with particularly low ongoing enrollment.

[2] CTE column totals include the 2,464 preapprenticeship enrollment numbers.

[3] Acronyms: Adults with Disabilities (AWD); Adults in Training to Support Child School Success (CSS); Adults in Training to Enter or Reenter the Workforce (WE/R)

[4] The unknown figures (Unk) represent reporting on students with instructional contact hours where the provider did not designate a program of enrollment for that student.

[5] This amount includes 82,000 enrolled students from WIOA, Title II that are 16 and 17-year-old students (allowable under WIOA, Title II).

*Others include: ROPs, Workforce Development Boards, and libraries.

Recommendations

There are no recommendations at this time.

Appendix A: Consortia Funding Distribution Schedule

Funding allocations to regional consortia were determined in collaboration with several key state agencies following a funding formula based on regional needs. This formula was developed using demographic data on adult populations, literacy, educational attainment, and immigration as well as consortium size and capacity. In the 2017–18 fiscal year, funds were apportioned to consortia by the State Controller in twelve equal payments on a monthly basis in accordance with the California *Education Code* Section 84912.

Table 1: Details on Funding Processing 2017–18 to State Controller’s Office

Item	Month	Amount
California Adult Education Program (CAEP) Consortia Apportionment	July 2017	\$126,241,058
CAEP Consortia Apportionment	September 2017	\$373,758,942
Total CAEP Funding		\$500,000,000

Each fiscal year, consortia have the option to elect a fiscal agent or to have funding allocations disseminated to each participating member agency directly from the state. This year, 42 consortia selected a fiscal agent funding model, and 29 opted for direct funding. Community college partners make up the majority of fiscal agents at 29, with 7 kindergarten through grade twelve (K–12) districts and 6 county offices of education (COEs) rounding out the remaining 13. This marks the third year in a row that has seen a decline in the number of consortia with fiscal agents. While the number of K–12 adult agencies serving in this capacity has remained relatively stable, community college fiscal agents have decreased by 40 percent since the 2015–16 year.

Table 2: Consortium Fiscal Agents by Program Year

Type of Fiscal Agent	2015–16	2016–17	2017–18	2018–19
K–12/COE	15	11	11	13
Direct Funded (no fiscal agent)	8	23	26	29
Community College	48	37	34	29
Total Consortia	71	71	71	71

In addition to the \$500 million apportioned for adult education by Assembly Bill 104, the Governor’s budget also included a provision for a cost-of-living adjustment which added \$21.5 million in funding for adult education services. Tables 3 and 4 break out funding allocations to K–12 districts, COEs, and community college partners for fiscal years 2017–18 and 2018–19.

Table 3: CAEP Funding by Agency Type

Type of Member	2017–18	2018–19
K–12	\$433,284,032	\$446,126,733
COE	\$8,479,501	\$12,724,430
Regional Occupational Center (ROP)	\$368,378	\$798,503
Community College	\$57,350,076	\$61,688,475
Other	\$518,013	\$222,859
Total CAEP Funding	\$500,000,000	\$521,561,000

Table 4: Percent Distribution of Funding by Agency Type (Member Reported)

Year	Community College Districts	COE / ROP	K–12	Other
2015–16	12%	2%	86%	0.1%
2016–17	12%	2%	86%	0.1%
2017–18	11%	2%	87%	0.1%
2018–19	12%	2%	86%	0.1%

Note: Amounts may be greater than 100 percent due to rounding.