- 1 any loan made pursuant to the authority of such subdivision prior to
- 2 such expiration and repeal.
- 3 § 2. This act shall take effect immediately and shall be deemed to
- 4 have been in full force and effect on and after April 1, 2018.

5 PART Q

- 6 Section 1. Subdivisions 2, 7, 8, 13, 14, 15, 16, 19, 20, 21 and 22 of
- 7 section 310 of the executive law, subdivisions 2, 8 and 14 as added by
- 8 chapter 261 of the laws of 1988, subdivisions 7 and 15 as amended by
- 9 chapter 22 of the laws of 2014, subdivision 13 as amended by chapter 506
- 10 of the laws of 2009, subdivision 16, as amended by section 3 of part BB
- 11 of chapter 59 of the laws of 2006, subdivisions 19, 20, 21 and 22 as
- 12 added by chapter 175 of the laws of 2010 are amended and a new subdivi-
- 13 sion 24 is added to read as follows:
- 14 2. "Contracting agency" shall mean a state agency or state-funded
- 15 entity which is a party or a proposed party to a state contract or, in
- 16 the case of a state contract described in paragraph (c) of subdivision
- 17 thirteen of this section, shall mean the New York state housing finance
- 18 agency, housing trust fund corporation or affordable housing corpo-
- 19 ration, whichever has made or proposes to make the grant or loan for the
- 20 state assisted housing project.
- 21 7. "Minority-owned business enterprise" shall mean a business enter-
- 22 prise, including a sole proprietorship, partnership, limited liability
- 23 company or corporation that is:
- 24 (a) at least fifty-one percent owned by one or more minority group
- 25 members;

- 1 (b) an enterprise in which such minority ownership is real, substan-
- 2 tial and continuing;
- 3 (c) an enterprise in which such minority ownership has and exercises
- 4 the authority to control independently the day-to-day business decisions
- 5 of the enterprise;
- 6 (d) an enterprise authorized to do business in this state and inde-
- 7 pendently owned and operated;
- 8 (e) an enterprise owned by an individual or individuals, whose owner-
- 9 ship, control and operation are relied upon for certification, with a
- 10 personal net worth that does not exceed three million five hundred thou-
- 11 sand dollars, or such other amount as the director shall set forth in
- 12 regulations, as adjusted annually on the first of January for inflation
- 13 according to the consumer price index of the previous year; and
- 14 (f) an enterprise that is a small business pursuant to subdivision
- 15 twenty of this section.
- 16 8. "Minority group member" shall mean a United States citizen or
- 17 permanent resident alien who is and can demonstrate membership in one of
- 18 the following groups:
- 19 (a) Black persons having origins in any of the Black African racial
- 20 groups;
- 21 (b) Hispanic persons of Mexican, Puerto Rican, Dominican, Cuban,
- 22 Central or South American of either Indian or Hispanic origin, regard-
- 23 less of race;
- 24 (c) Native American or Alaskan native persons having origins in any of
- 25 the original peoples of North America.
- 26 (d) Asian and Pacific Islander persons having origins in any of the
- 27 Far East countries, South East Asia, the Indian subcontinent or the
- 28 Pacific Islands.

13. "State contract" shall mean: (a) a written agreement or purchase 1 order instrument, providing for a total expenditure in excess of [twenty-fivel fifty thousand dollars, whereby a contracting agency is commit-3 ted to expend or does expend or grant funds in return for labor, services including but not limited to legal, financial and other profes-5 sional services, supplies, equipment, materials or any combination of 6 the foregoing, to be performed for, or rendered or furnished to the contracting agency; (b) a written agreement in excess of [one] two 8 hundred thousand dollars whereby a contracting agency is committed to expend or does expend or grant funds for the acquisition, construction, 10 demolition, replacement, major repair or renovation of real property and 11 improvements thereon; [and] (c) a written agreement in excess of [one] 12 two hundred thousand dollars whereby the owner of a state assisted hous-13 ing project is committed to expend or does expend funds for the acquisi-14 tion, construction, demolition, replacement, major repair or renovation 15 of real property and improvements thereon for such project; and (d) a 16 written agreement or purchase order instrument, providing for a total 17 expenditure in excess of fifty thousand dollars, whereby a state-funded 18 entity is committed to expend or does expend funds paid to the state-19 funded entity by the state of New York, including those paid to the 20 state-funded entity pursuant to an appropriation, for any product or 21 22 service. 14. "Subcontract" shall mean an agreement [providing for a total 23 of twenty-five thousand dollars for the expenditure in excess 24 construction, demolition, replacement, major repair, renovation, plan-25 ning or design of real property and improvements thereon] between a 26 contractor and any individual or business enterprise, including a sole 27 proprietorship, partnership, corporation, or not-for-profit corporation,

- 1 in which a portion of a contractor's obligation under a state contract
- 2 is undertaken or assumed, but shall not include any construction, demo-
- 3 lition, replacement, major repair, renovation, planning or design of
- 4 real property or improvements thereon for the beneficial use of the
- 5 contractor.
- 6 15. "Women-owned business enterprise" shall mean a business enter-
- 7 prise, including a sole proprietorship, partnership, limited liability
- 8 company or corporation that is:
- 9 (a) at least fifty-one percent owned by one or more United States
- 10 citizens or permanent resident aliens who are women;
- 11 (b) an enterprise in which the ownership interest of such women is
- 12 real, substantial and continuing;
- 13 (c) an enterprise in which such women ownership has and exercises the
- 14 authority to control independently the day-to-day business decisions of
- 15 the enterprise;
- 16 (d) an enterprise authorized to do business in this state and inde-
- 17 pendently owned and operated;
- 18 (e) an enterprise owned by an individual or individuals, whose owner-
- 19 ship, control and operation are relied upon for certification, with a
- 20 personal net worth that does not exceed three million five hundred thou-
- 21 sand dollars, or such other amount as the director shall set forth in
- 22 regulations, as adjusted annually on the first of January for inflation
- 23 according to the consumer price index of the previous year; and
- 24 (f) an enterprise that is a small business pursuant to subdivision
- 25 twenty of this section.
- 26 A firm owned by a minority group member who is also a woman may be
- 27 certified as a minority-owned business enterprise, a women-owned busi-
- 28 ness enterprise, or both, and may be counted towards either a minority-

- 1 owned business enterprise goal or a women-owned business enterprise
- 2 goal, in regard to any contract or any goal, set by an agency or author-
- 3 ity, but such participation may not be counted towards both such goals.
- 4 Such an enterprise's participation in a contract may not be divided
- 5 between the minority-owned business enterprise goal and the women-owned
- 6 business enterprise goal.
- 7 16. "Statewide advocate" shall mean the person appointed by the
- 8 [commissioner] director to serve in the capacity of the minority and
- 9 women-owned business enterprise statewide advocate.
- 10 19. "Personal net worth" shall mean the aggregate adjusted net value
- 11 of the assets of an individual remaining after total liabilities are
- 12 deducted. Personal net worth includes the individual's share of assets
- 13 held jointly with said individual's spouse and does not include the
- 14 individual's ownership interest in the certified minority and women-
- 15 owned business enterprise, the individual's [equity in his or her prima-
- 16 ry residence] ownership interest in any holding company that leases real
- 17 property, machinery, equipment, or vehicles exclusively to the certified
- 18 minority or women-owned business enterprise, up to two hundred percent
- 19 of the median value of owner-occupied housing units in the municipality
- 20 in which the individual resides, or up to five hundred thousand dollars
- 21 of the present cash value of any qualified retirement savings plan or
- 22 individual retirement account held by the individual less any penalties
- 23 for early withdrawal.
- 24 20. "Small business" as used in this section, unless otherwise indi-
- 25 cated, shall mean a business which has a significant business presence
- 26 in the state, is independently owned and operated, not dominant in its
- 27 field and employs, based on its industry, a certain number of persons as
- 28 determined by the director[, but not to exceed three hundred], taking

- 1 into consideration factors which include, but are not limited to, feder-
- 2 al small business administration standards pursuant to 13 CFR part 121
- 3 and any amendments thereto. The director may issue regulations on the
- 4 construction of the terms in this definition.
- 5 21. "The [2010] disparity study" shall refer to the most recent
- 6 disparity study commissioned by the [empire state development corpo-
- 7 ration] department of economic development, pursuant to section three
- 8 hundred twelve-a of this article[, and published on April twenty-nine,
- 9 two thousand ten].
- 10 22. "Diversity practices" shall mean the contractor's practices and
- 11 policies with respect to:
- 12 (a) [utilizing] mentoring certified minority and women-owned business
- 13 enterprises in contracts awarded by a state agency or other public
- 14 corporation, as subcontractors and suppliers; [and]
- 15 (b) entering into partnerships, joint ventures or other similar
- 16 arrangements with certified minority and women-owned business enter-
- 17 prises as defined in this article or other applicable statute or regu-
- 18 lation governing an entity's utilization of minority or women-owned
- 19 business enterprises; and
- 20 (c) the representation of minority group members and women as members
- 21 of the board of directors or executive officers of the contractor.
- 22 24. "State-funded entity" shall mean any unit of local government,
- 23 including, but not limited to, a county, city, town, village, or school
- 24 district that is paid pursuant to an appropriation in any state fiscal
- 25 year.
- 26 § 2. Subdivision 4 of section 311 of the executive law, as amended by
- 27 chapter 361 of the laws of 2009, is amended to read as follows:

- 1 4. The director [may] shall provide assistance to, and facilitate
- 2 access to programs serving [certified businesses as well as applicants]
- 3 minority and women-owned business enterprises to ensure that such busi-
- 4 nesses benefit, as needed, from technical, managerial and financial, and
- 5 general business assistance; training; marketing; organization and
- 6 personnel skill development; project management assistance; technology
- 7 assistance; bond and insurance education assistance; and other business
- 8 development assistance. The director shall maintain a toll-free number
- 9 at the department of economic development to be used to answer questions
- 10 concerning the MWBE certification process. In addition, the director
- 11 may, either independently or in conjunction with other state agencies:
- 12 (a) develop a clearinghouse of information on programs and services
- 13 provided by entities that may assist such businesses;
- 14 (b) review bonding and paperwork requirements imposed by contracting
- 15 agencies that may unnecessarily impede the ability of such businesses to
- 16 compete; and
- 17 (c) seek to maximize utilization by minority and women-owned business
- 18 enterprises of available federal resources including but not limited to
- 19 federal grants, loans, loan guarantees, surety bonding guarantees, tech-
- 20 nical assistance, and programs and services of the federal small busi-
- 21 ness administration.
- 22 § 3. Section 311-a of the executive law, as added by section 4 of part
- 23 BB of chapter 59 of the laws of 2006, is amended to read as follows:
- 24 § 311-a. Minority and women-owned business enterprise statewide advo-
- 25 cate. 1. There is hereby established within the [department of econom-
- 26 ic] division of minority and women's business development [an office of
- 27 the minority and women-owned business enterprise] a statewide advocate.
- 28 The statewide advocate shall be appointed by the [commissioner with the

- l advice of the small business advisory board as established in section
- 2 one hundred thirty-three of the economic development law and shall serve
- 3 in the unclassified service of the director. [The statewide advocate
- 4 shall be located in the Albany empire state development office.]
- 5 2. The advocate shall act as a liaison for minority and women-owned
- 6 business enterprises (MWBEs) to assist them in obtaining technical,
- 7 managerial, financial and other business assistance for certified busi-
- 8 nesses and applicants. The advocate shall receive and investigate
- 9 complaints brought by or on behalf of MWBEs concerning [certification
- 10 delays and instances of] violations of [law] the requirements of this
- 11 article by contractors and state agencies. [The statewide advocate shall
- 12 assist certified businesses and applicants in the certification process.
- 13 Other functions of the statewide advocate shall be directed by the
- 14 commissioner. The advocate may request and the director may appoint
- 15 staff and employees of the division of minority and women business
- 16 development to support the administration of the office of the statewide
- 17 advocate.]
- 18 3. The statewide advocate [shall establish a toll-free number at the
- 19 department of economic development to be used to answer questions
- 20 concerning the MWBE certification process! shall conduct periodic audits
- 21 of state agencies' compliance with the requirements of section three
- 22 hundred fifteen of this article, which audits shall include a review of
- 23 the books and records of state agencies concerning, among other things,
- 24 annual agency expenditures, annual participation of minority and women-
- 25 owned business enterprises as prime contractors and subcontractors in
- 26 state agencies' state contracts, and documentation of state agencies'
- 27 good faith efforts to maximize minority and women-owned business enter-
- 28 prise participation in such state agencies' contracting.

- 1 [4. The statewide advocate shall report to the director and commis-
- 2 sioner by November fifteenth on an annual basis on all activities
- 3 related to fulfilling the obligations of the office of the statewide
- 4 advocate. The commissioner shall include the unedited text of the state-
- 5 wide advocate's report within the reports submitted by the department of
- 6 economic development to the governor and the legislature.]
- 7 § 4. Section 312-a of the executive law, as amended by section 1 of
- 8 part Q of chapter 58 of the laws of 2015, is amended to read as follows:
- 9 § 312-a. Study of minority and women-owned business [enterprise
- 10 programs] enterprises. 1. The director of the division of minority and
- 11 [women-owned] women's business development [in the department of econom-
- 12 ic development] is authorized and directed to recommission a statewide
- 13 disparity study regarding the participation of minority and women-owned
- 14 business enterprises in state contracts since the amendment of this
- 15 article to be delivered to the governor and legislature [no later than
- 16 August fifteenth, two thousand sixteen]. The study shall be prepared by
- 17 an entity independent of the department and selected through a request
- 18 for proposal process. The purpose of such study is:
- 19 (a) to determine whether there is a disparity between the number of
- 20 qualified minority and women-owned businesses ready, willing and able to
- 21 perform state contracts for commodities, services and construction, and
- 22 the number of such contractors actually engaged to perform such
- 23 contracts, and to determine what changes, if any, should be made to
- 24 state policies affecting minority and women-owned business enterprises;
- 25 and (b) to determine whether there is a disparity between the number of
- 26 qualified minorities and women ready, willing and able, with respect to
- 27 labor markets, qualifications and other relevant factors, to participate
- 28 in contractor employment, management level bodies, including boards of

- 1 directors, and as senior executive officers within contracting entities
- 2 and the number of such group members actually employed or affiliated
- 3 with state contractors in the aforementioned capacities, and to deter-
- 4 mine what changes, if any, should be made to state policies affecting
- 5 minority and women group populations with regard to state contractors'
- 6 employment and appointment practices relative to diverse group members.
- 7 Such study shall include, but not be limited to, an analysis of the
- 8 history of minority and women-owned business enterprise programs and
- 9 their effectiveness as a means of securing and ensuring participation by
- 10 minorities and women, and a disparity analysis by market area and region
- 11 of the state. Such study shall distinguish between minority males,
- 12 minority females and non-minority females in the statistical analysis.
- 13 2. The director of the division of minority and [women-owned] women's
- 14 business development is directed to transmit the disparity study to the
- 15 governor and the legislature [not later than August fifteenth, two thou-
- 16 sand sixteen], and to post the study on the website of the department of
- 17 economic development.
- 18 § 5. Section 313 of the executive law, as amended by chapter 175 of
- 19 the laws of 2010, is amended to read as follows:
- 20 § 313. Opportunities for minority and women-owned business enter-
- 21 prises. 1. [Goals and requirements for agencies and contractors. Each
- 22 agency shall structure procurement procedures for contracts made direct-
- 23 ly or indirectly to minority and women-owned business enterprises, in
- 24 accordance with the findings of the two thousand ten disparity study,
- 25 consistent with the purposes of this article, to attempt to achieve the
- 26 following results with regard to total annual statewide procurement:
- 27 (a) construction industry for certified minority-owned business enter-
- 28 prises: fourteen and thirty-four hundredths percent;

- 1 (b) construction industry for certified women-owned business enter-
- 2 prises: eight and forty-one hundredths percent;
- 3 (c) construction related professional services industry for certified
- 4 minority-owned business enterprises: thirteen and twenty-one hundredths
- 5 percent;
- 6 (d) construction related professional services industry for certified
- 7 women-owned business enterprises: eleven and thirty-two hundredths
- 8 percent;
- 9 (e) non-construction related services industry for certified minori-
- 10 ty-owned business enterprises: nineteen and sixty hundredths percent;
- 11 (f) non-construction related services industry for certified women-
- 12 owned business enterprises: seventeen and forty-four hundredths percent;
- 13 (g) commodities industry for certified minority-owned business enter-
- 14 prises: sixteen and eleven hundredths percent;
- 15 (h) commodities industry for certified women-owned business enter-
- 16 prises: ten and ninety-three hundredths percent;
- 17 (i) overall agency total dollar value of procurement for certified
- 18 minority-owned business enterprises: sixteen and fifty-three hundredths
- 19 percent;
- 20 (j) overall agency total dollar value of procurement for certified
- 21 women-owned business enterprises: twelve and thirty-nine hundredths
- 22 percent; and
- 23 (k) overall agency total dollar value of procurement for certified
- 24 minority, women-owned business enterprises: twenty-eight and ninety-two
- 25 hundredths percent.
- 26 1-a. The director shall ensure that each state agency has been
- 27 provided with a copy of the two thousand ten disparity study.

- 1 1-b. Each agency shall develop and adopt agency-specific goals based
- 2 on the findings of the two thousand ten disparity study.
- 3 2.] The director shall promulgate rules and regulations [pursuant to
- 4 the goals established in subdivision one of this section] that provide
- 5 measures and procedures to ensure that certified minority and women-
- 6 owned businesses shall be given the opportunity for maximum feasible
- 7 participation in the performance of state contracts and to assist in the
- 8 agency's identification of those state contracts for which minority and
- 9 women-owned certified businesses may best bid to actively and affirma-
- 10 tively promote and assist their participation in the performance of
- 11 state contracts [so as to facilitate the agency's achievement of the
- 12 maximum feasible portion of the goals for state contracts to such busi-
- 13 nesses].
- 14 [2-a.] 2. The director shall promulgate rules and regulations that
- 15 will accomplish the following:
- 16 (a) provide for the certification and decertification of minority and
- 17 women owned business enterprises for all agencies through a single proc-
- 18 ess that meets applicable requirements;
- 19 (b) require that each contract solicitation document accompanying each
- 20 solicitation set forth the expected degree of minority and women-owned
- 21 business enterprise participation based, in part, on:
- 22 (i) the potential subcontract opportunities available in the prime
- 23 procurement contract; [and]
- 24 (ii) the availability[, as contained within the study,] of certified
- 25 minority and women-owned business enterprises to respond competitively
- 26 to the potential subcontract opportunities, as reflected in the divi-
- 27 sion's directory of certified minority and women-owned business enter-
- 28 <u>prises; and</u>

- 1 (iii) the findings of the disparity study.
- 2 (c) [require that each agency provide a current list of certified
- 3 minority business enterprises to each prospective contractor;
- 4 (d)] allow a contractor that is a certified minority-owned or women-
- 5 owned business enterprise to use the work it performs to meet require-
- 6 ments for use of certified minority-owned or women-owned business enter-
- 7 prises as subcontractors;
- 8 (d) establish criteria for agencies to credit the participation of
- 9 minority and women-owned business enterprises towards the achievement of
- 10 the minority and women-owned business enterprise participation goals on
- 11 a state contract based on the commercially useful function provided by
- 12 each minority and women-owned business enterprise on the contract;
- 13 (e) provide for joint ventures, which a bidder may count toward meet-
- 14 ing its minority and women-owned business enterprise participation;
- 15 (f) consistent with subdivision six of this section, provide for
- 16 circumstances under which an agency or state-funded entity may waive
- 17 obligations of the contractor relating to minority and women-owned busi-
- 18 ness enterprise participation;
- 19 (g) require that an agency or state-funded entity verify that minority
- 20 and women-owned business enterprises listed in a successful bid are
- 21 actually participating to the extent listed in the project for which the
- 22 bid was submitted;
- 23 (h) provide for the collection of statistical data by each agency
- 24 concerning actual minority and women-owned business enterprise partic-
- 25 ipation; [and]
- 26 (i) require each agency to consult the most current disparity study
- 27 when calculating [agency-wide and contract specific] contract-specific
- 28 participation goals pursuant to this article; and

(j) provide for the periodic collection of reports from state-funded 1 entities in such form and at such time as the director shall require. 3. Solely for the purpose of providing the opportunity for meaningful 3 participation by certified businesses in the performance of state contracts as provided in this section, state contracts shall include 5 leases of real property by a state agency to a lessee where: the terms of such leases provide for the construction, demolition, replacement, major repair or renovation of real property and improvements thereon by such lessee; and the cost of such construction, demolition, replacement, 9 major repair or renovation of real property and improvements thereon 10 shall exceed the sum of [one] two hundred thousand dollars. Reports to 11 the director pursuant to section three hundred fifteen of this article 12 shall include activities with respect to all such state contracts. 13 Contracting agencies shall include or require to be included with 14 respect to state contracts for the acquisition, construction, demoli-15 tion, replacement, major repair or renovation of real property and 16 improvements thereon, such provisions as may be necessary to effectuate 17 the provisions of this section in every bid specification and state 18 contract, including, but not limited to: (a) provisions requiring 19 contractors to make a good faith effort to solicit active participation 20 by enterprises identified in the directory of certified businesses 21 22 [provided to the contracting agency by the office]; (b) requiring the parties to agree as a condition of entering into such contract, to be 23 bound by the provisions of section three hundred sixteen of this arti-24 cle; and (c) requiring the contractor to include the provisions set 25 forth in paragraphs (a) and (b) of this subdivision in every subcontract 26 in a manner that the provisions will be binding upon each subcontractor 27

as to work in connection with such contract. Provided, however, that no

28

- 1 such provisions shall be binding upon contractors or subcontractors in
- 2 the performance of work or the provision of services that are unrelated,
- 3 separate or distinct from the state contract as expressed by its terms,
- 4 and nothing in this section shall authorize the director or any
- 5 contracting agency to impose any requirement on a contractor or subcon-
- 6 tractor except with respect to a state contract.
- 7 4. In the implementation of this section, the contracting agency shall
- 8 (a) consult the findings contained within the disparity study evidencing
- 9 relevant industry specific [availability of certified businesses]
- 10 disparities in the utilization of minority and women-owned businesses
- 11 relative to their availability;
- 12 (b) implement a program that will enable the agency to evaluate each
- 13 contract to determine the [appropriateness of the] appropriate goal
- 14 [pursuant to subdivision one of this section] for participation by
- 15 minority-owned business enterprises and women-owned business
- 16 enterprises;
- 17 (c) consider where practicable, the severability of construction
- 18 projects and other bundled contracts; and
- 19 (d) consider compliance with the requirements of any federal law
- 20 concerning opportunities for minority and women-owned business enter-
- 21 prises which effectuates the purpose of this section. The contracting
- 22 agency shall determine whether the imposition of the requirements of any
- 23 such law duplicate or conflict with the provisions hereof and if such
- 24 duplication or conflict exists, the contracting agency shall waive the
- 25 applicability of this section to the extent of such duplication or
- 26 conflict.
- 27 5. (a) Contracting agencies shall administer the rules and regulations
- 28 promulgated by the director in a good faith effort to [meet] achieve the

maximum feasible [portion of the agency's goals adopted] participation of minority and women-owned business enterprises pursuant to this article and the regulations of the director. Such rules and regulations: 3 shall require a contractor to submit a utilization plan after bids are opened, when bids are required, but prior to the award of a state 5 contract; shall require the contracting agency to review the utilization 6 plan submitted by the contractor [and to post the utilization plan and any waivers of compliance issued pursuant to subdivision six of this 8 section on the website of the contracting agency] within a reasonable period of time as established by the director; shall require the 10 contracting agency to notify the contractor in writing within a period 11 of time specified by the director as to any deficiencies contained in 12 the contractor's utilization plan; shall require remedy thereof within a 13 period of time specified by the director; shall require the contractor 14 to submit periodic compliance reports relating to the operation and 15 implementation of any utilization plan; shall not allow any automatic 16 waivers but shall allow a contractor to apply for a partial or total 17 waiver of the minority and women owned business enterprise participation 18 requirements pursuant to subdivisions six and seven of this section; 19 20 shall allow a contractor to file a complaint with the director pursuant 21 to subdivision eight of this section in the event a contracting agency has failed or refused to issue a waiver of the minority and women-owned 22 business enterprise participation requirements or has denied such 23 request for a waiver; and shall allow a contracting agency to file a 24 complaint with the director pursuant to subdivision nine of this section 25 in the event a contractor is failing or has failed to comply with the 26 minority and women-owned business enterprise participation requirements 27 set forth in the state contract where no waiver has been granted.

(b) The rules and regulations promulgated pursuant to this subdivision 1 regarding a utilization plan shall provide that where enterprises have been identified within a utilization plan, a contractor shall attempt, 3 in good faith, to utilize such enterprise at least to the extent indicated. A contracting agency may require a contractor to indicate, within utilization plan, what measures and procedures he or she intends to take to comply with the provisions of this article, but may not require, as a condition of award of, or compliance with, a contract that a 8 contractor utilize a particular enterprise in performance of the contract. 10 (c) Without limiting other grounds for the disqualification of bids or 11 proposals on the basis of non-responsibility, a contracting agency may 12 disqualify the bid or proposal of a contractor as being non-responsible 13 for failure to remedy notified deficiencies contained in the contrac-14 tor's utilization plan within a period of time specified in regulations 15 promulgated by the director after receiving notification of such defi-16 ciencies from the contracting agency. Where failure to remedy any noti-17 fied deficiency in the utilization plan is a ground for disqualifica-18 tion, that issue and all other grounds for disqualification shall be 19 20 stated in writing by the contracting agency. Where the contracting agency states that a failure to remedy any notified deficiency in the utili-21 zation plan is a ground for disqualification the contractor shall be 22 23 entitled to an administrative hearing, on a record, involving all grounds stated by the contracting agency. Such hearing shall be 24 conducted by the appropriate authority of the contracting agency to 25 review the determination of disqualification. A final administrative 26 determination made following such hearing shall be reviewable in a 27 proceeding commenced under article seventy-eight of the civil practice 1 law and rules, provided that such proceeding is commenced within thirty

2 days of the notice given by certified mail return receipt requested

3 rendering such final administrative determination. Such proceeding shall

4 be commenced in the supreme court, appellate division, third department

5 and such proceeding shall be preferred over all other civil causes

s except election causes, and shall be heard and determined in preference

to all other civil business pending therein, except election matters,

8 irrespective of position on the calendar. Appeals taken to the court of

9 appeals of the state of New York shall be subject to the same prefer-

10 ence.

6. Where it appears that a contractor cannot, after a good faith 11 12 effort, comply with the minority and women-owned business enterprise participation requirements set forth in a particular state contract, a 13 14 contractor may file a written application with the contracting agency 15 requesting a partial or total waiver of such requirements setting forth the reasons for such contractor's inability to meet any or all of the 16 participation requirements together with an explanation of the efforts 17 18 undertaken by the contractor to obtain the required minority and women-19 owned business enterprise participation. In implementing the provisions 20 of this section, the contracting agency shall consider the number and 21 types of minority and women owned business enterprises [located] avail-22 able to provide goods or services required under the contract in the 23 region in which the state contract is to be performed, the total dollar 24 value of the state contract, the scope of work to be performed and the 25 project size and term. If, based on such considerations, the contracting agency determines there is not a reasonable availability of contractors 26 on the list of certified business to furnish services for the project, 27 it shall issue a waiver of compliance to the contractor. In making such 28

- 1 determination, the contracting agency shall first consider the avail-
- 2 ability of other business enterprises located in the region and shall
- 3 thereafter consider the financial ability of minority and women-owned
- 4 businesses located outside the region in which the contract is to be
- 5 performed to perform the state contract.
- 6 7. For purposes of determining a contractor's good faith effort to
- 7 comply with the requirements of this section or to be entitled to a
- 8 waiver therefrom the contracting agency shall consider:
- 9 (a) whether the contractor has [advertised in general circulation
- 10 media, trade association publications, and minority-focus and women-fo-
- 11 cus media and, in such event, (i) whether or not certified minority or
- 12 women-owned businesses which have been solicited by the contractor
- 13 exhibited interest in submitting proposals for a particular project by
- 14 attending] attended a pre-bid conference, if any, scheduled by the state
- 15 agency awarding the state contract with certified minority and women-
- 16 owned business enterprises; and
- 17 [(ii) whether certified businesses which have been solicited by the
- 18 contractor have responded in a timely fashion to the contractor's solic-
- 19 itations for timely competitive bid quotations prior to the contracting
- 20 agency's bid date; and]
- 21 (b) whether [there has been] the contractor provided timely written
- 22 notification of subcontracting opportunities on the state contract to
- 23 appropriate certified businesses that appear in the directory of certi-
- 24 fied businesses prepared pursuant to paragraph (f) of subdivision three
- 25 of section three hundred eleven of this article; and
- 26 (c) whether the contractor can reasonably structure the amount of work
- 27 to be performed under subcontracts in order to increase the likelihood
- 28 of participation by certified businesses.

8. In the event that a contracting agency fails or refuses to issue a

2 waiver to a contractor as requested within twenty days after having made

3 application therefor pursuant to subdivision six of this section or if

the contracting agency denies such application, in whole or in part, the

contractor may file a complaint with the director pursuant to section

6 three hundred sixteen of this article setting forth the facts and

7 circumstances giving rise to the contractor's complaint together with a

8 demand for relief. The contractor shall serve a copy of such complaint

9 upon the contracting agency by personal service or by certified mail,

10 return receipt requested. The contracting agency shall be afforded an

11 opportunity to respond to such complaint in writing.

12 9. If, after the review of a contractor's minority and women owned

13 business utilization plan or review of a periodic compliance report and

14 after such contractor has been afforded an opportunity to respond to a

15 notice of deficiency issued by the contracting agency in connection

16 therewith, it appears that a contractor is failing or refusing to comply

17 with the minority and women-owned business participation requirements as

18 set forth in the state contract and where no waiver from such require-

19 ments has been granted, the contracting agency may file a written

20 complaint with the director pursuant to section three hundred sixteen of

21 this article setting forth the facts and circumstances giving rise to

22 the contracting agency's complaint together with a demand for relief.

23 The contracting agency shall serve a copy of such complaint upon the

24 contractor by personal service or by certified mail, return receipt

25 requested. The contractor shall be afforded an opportunity to respond to

26 such complaint in writing.

27 § 6. Section 314 of the executive law, as added by chapter 261 of the

28 laws of 1988, subdivision 2-a as amended by chapter 175 of the laws of

- 1 2010, subdivision 4 as amended and subdivision 5 as added by chapter 399
- 2 of the laws of 2014, is amended to read as follows:
- 3 § 314. Statewide certification program. 1. The director shall promul-
- 4 gate rules and regulations providing for the establishment of a state-
- 5 wide certification program including rules and regulations governing the
- 6 approval, denial or revocation of any such certification. Such rules
- 7 shall set forth the maximum personal net worth of a minority group
- 8 member or woman who may be relied upon to certify a business as a minor-
- 9 ity-owned business enterprise or women-owned business enterprise, and
- 10 may establish different maximum levels of personal net worth for minori-
- 11 ty group members and women on an industry-by-industry basis for such
- 12 <u>industries</u> as the director shall determine. Such rules and regulations
- 13 shall include, but not be limited to, such matters as may be required to
- 14 ensure that the established procedures thereunder shall at least be in
- 15 compliance with the code of fair procedure set forth in section seven-
- 16 ty-three of the civil rights law.
- 17 2. For the purposes of this article, the office shall be responsible
- 18 for verifying businesses as being owned, operated, and controlled by
- 19 minority group members or women and for certifying such verified busi-
- 20 nesses. The director shall prepare a directory of certified businesses
- 21 for use by contracting agencies and contractors in carrying out the
- 22 provisions of this article. The director shall periodically update the
- 23 directory.
- 24 2-a. (a) The director shall establish a procedure enabling the office
- 25 to accept New York municipal corporation certification verification for
- 26 minority and women-owned business enterprise applicants in lieu of
- 27 requiring the applicant to complete the state certification process. The
- 28 director shall promulgate rules and regulations to set forth criteria

- 1 for the acceptance of municipal corporation certification. All eligible
- 2 municipal corporation certifications shall require business enterprises
- 3 seeking certification to meet the following standards:
- 4 (i) have at least fifty-one percent ownership by a minority or a
- 5 women-owned enterprise and be owned by United States citizens or perma-
- 6 nent resident aliens;
- 7 (ii) be an enterprise in which the minority and/or women-ownership
- 8 interest is real, substantial and continuing;
- 9 (iii) be an enterprise in which the minority and/or women-ownership
- 10 has and exercises the authority to control independently the day-to-day
- 11 business decisions of the enterprise;
- 12 (iv) be an enterprise authorized to do business in this state;
- 13 (v) be subject to a physical site inspection to verify the fifty-one
- 14 percent ownership requirement;
- 15 (vi) be owned by an individual or individuals, whose ownership,
- 16 control and operation are relied upon for certification, with a personal
- 17 net worth that does not exceed three million five hundred thousand
- 18 dollars, or such other amount as the director shall set forth in regu-
- 19 lations, as adjusted annually for inflation according to the consumer
- 20 price index; and
- 21 (vii) be an enterprise that is a small business pursuant to subdivi-
- 22 sion twenty of section three hundred ten of this article.
- 23 (b) The director shall work with all municipal corporations that have
- 24 a municipal minority and women-owned business enterprise program to
- 25 develop standards to accept state certification to meet the municipal
- 26 corporation minority and women-owned business enterprise certification
- 27 standards.

- 1 (c) The director shall establish a procedure enabling the division to
- 2 accept federal certification verification for minority and women-owned
- 3 business enterprise applicants, provided said standards comport with
- 4 those required by the state minority and women-owned business program,
- 5 in lieu of requiring the applicant to complete the state certification
- 6 process. The director shall promulgate rules and regulations to set
- 7 forth criteria for the acceptance of federal certification.
- 8 2-b. Each business applying for minority or women-owned business
- 9 enterprise certification pursuant to this section must agree to allow:
- 10 (i) the department of taxation and finance to share its tax information
- 11 with the division and (ii) the department of labor to share its tax and
- 12 employer information with the division.
- 13 3. Following application for certification pursuant to this section,
- 14 the director shall provide the applicant with written notice of the
- 15 status of the application, including notice of any outstanding deficien-
- 16 cies[, within thirty days]. Within [sixty] thirty days of submission of
- 17 a final completed application, the director shall provide the applicant
- 18 with written notice of a determination by the office approving or deny-
- 19 ing such certification and, in the event of a denial a statement setting
- 20 forth the reasons for such denial. Upon a determination denying or
- 21 revoking certification, the business enterprise for which certification
- 22 has been so denied or revoked shall, upon written request made within
- 23 thirty days from receipt of notice of such determination, be entitled to
- 24 a hearing before an independent hearing officer designated for such
- 25 purpose by the director. In the event that a request for a hearing is
- 26 not made within such thirty day period, such determination shall be
- 27 deemed to be final. The independent hearing officer shall conduct a
- 28 hearing and upon the conclusion of such hearing, issue a written recom-

- 1 mendation to the director to affirm, reverse or modify such determi-
- 2 nation of the director. Such written recommendation shall be issued to
- 3 the parties. The director, within thirty days, by order, must accept,
- 4 reject or modify such recommendation of the hearing officer and set
- 5 forth in writing the reasons therefor. The director shall serve a copy
- 6 of such order and reasons therefor upon the business enterprise by
- 7 personal service or by certified mail return receipt requested. The
- 8 order of the director shall be subject to review pursuant to article
- 9 seventy-eight of the civil practice law and rules.
- 10 4. The director may, after performing an availability analysis and
- 11 upon a finding that industry-specific factors coupled with personal net
- 12 worth or small business eligibility requirements pursuant to subdivi-
- 13 sions nineteen and twenty of section three hundred ten of this article,
- 14 respectively, have led to the significant exclusion of businesses owned
- 15 by minority group members or women in that industry, grant provisional
- 16 MWBE certification status to applicants from that designated industry,
- 17 provided, however, that all other eligibility requirements pursuant to
- 18 subdivision seven or fifteen of section three hundred ten of this arti-
- 19 cle, as applicable, are satisfied. Any industry-based determination made
- 20 under this section by the director shall be made widely available to the
- 21 public and posted on the division's website.
- 22 5. With the exception of provisional MWBE certification, as provided
- 23 for in subdivision twenty-three of section three hundred ten of this
- 24 article, all minority and women-owned business enterprise certifications
- 25 shall be valid for a period of three years.
- 26 § 7. Subdivisions 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7 of section 315 of the executive
- 27 law, subdivision 2 as added by chapter 261 of the laws of 1988, and

- 1 subdivision 3 as amended and subdivisions 4, 5, 6 and 7 as added by
- 2 chapter 175 of the laws of 2010, are amended to read as follows:
- 3 2. [Each contracting agency shall provide to prospective bidders a
- 4 current copy of the directory of certified businesses, and a copy of the
- 5 regulations required pursuant to sections three hundred twelve and three
- 6 hundred thirteen of this article at the time bids or proposals are
- 7 solicited.
- 8 3.] Each contracting agency shall report to the director with respect
- 9 to activities undertaken to promote employment of minority group members
- 10 and women and promote and increase participation by certified businesses
- 11 with respect to state contracts and subcontracts. Such reports shall be
- 12 submitted periodically, but not less frequently than annually, as
- 13 required by the director, and shall include such information as is
- 14 necessary for the director to determine whether the contracting agency
- 15 and contractor have complied with the purposes of this article, includ-
- 16 ing, without limitation, a summary of all waivers of the requirements of
- 17 subdivisions six and seven of section three hundred thirteen of this
- 18 article allowed by the contracting agency during the period covered by
- 19 the report, [including a description of the basis of the waiver request
- 20 and the rationale for granting any such waiver] any instances in which
- 21 the state agency has deemed a contractor to have committed a violation
- 22 pursuant to section three hundred sixteen-a of this article, and such
- 23 other information as the director shall require. Each agency shall also
- 24 include in such annual report whether or not it has been required to
- 25 prepare a remedial plan, and, if so, the plan and the extent to which
- 26 the agency has complied with each element of the plan.
- 27 [4.] 3. The division of minority and women's business development
- 28 shall issue an annual report which: (a) summarizes the report submitted

by each contracting agency pursuant to subdivision [three] two of this (b) contains such comparative or other information as the 2 section; 3 director deems appropriate, including but not limited to goals compared to actual participation of minority and women-owned business enterprises in state contracting, to evaluate the effectiveness of the activities 6 undertaken by each such contracting agency to promote increased participation by certified minority or women-owned businesses with respect to state contracts and subcontracts; (c) contains a summary of all waivers 8 9 of the requirements of subdivisions six and seven of section three hundred thirteen of this article allowed by each contracting agency 10 during the period covered by the report[, including a description of the 11 12 basis of the waiver request and the contracting agency's rationale for granting any such waiver]; and (d) [describes any efforts to create a 13 database or other information storage and retrieval system containing 14 15 information relevant to contracting with minority and women-owned busi-16 ness enterprises; and (e)] contains a summary of (i) all determinations 17 of violations of this article by a contractor or a contracting agency made during the period covered by the annual report pursuant to section 18 19 three hundred sixteen-a of this article and (ii) the penalties or sanctions, if any, assessed in connection with 20 such determinations and the rationale for such penalties or sanctions. 21 Copies of the annual report shall be provided to the commissioner, the 22 23 governor, the comptroller, the temporary president of the senate, the 24 speaker of the assembly, the minority leader of the senate, the minority leader of the assembly and shall also be made widely available to the 25 public via, among other things, publication on a website maintained by 26 27 the division of minority and women's business development.

1 [5.] 4. Each agency shall include in its annual report to the governor

- and legislature pursuant to section one hundred sixty-four of [the exec-
- 3 utive law] this chapter its annual goals for contracts with minority-
- 4 owned and women-owned business enterprises, the number of actual
- 5 contracts issued to minority-owned and women-owned business enterprises;
- 6 and a summary of all waivers of the requirements of subdivisions six and
- 7 seven of section three hundred thirteen of this article allowed by the
- 8 reporting agency during the preceding year, including a description of
- 9 the basis of the waiver request and the rationale for granting such
- 10 waiver. Each agency shall also include in such annual report whether or
- 11 not it has been required to prepare a remedial plan, and, if so, the
- 12 plan and the extent to which the agency has complied with each element
- 13 of the plan.
- 14 [6.] 5. Each contracting agency that substantially fails to [meet the
- 15 goals supported by the disparity study] make a good faith effort, as
- 16 defined by regulation of the director, to achieve the maximum feasible
- 17 participation of minority and women-owned business enterprises in such
- 18 agency's contracting shall be required to submit to the director a reme-
- 19 dial action plan to remedy such failure.
- 20 [7.] 6. If it is determined by the director that any agency has failed
- 21 to act in good faith to implement the remedial action plan, pursuant to
- 22 subdivision [six] five of this section within one year, the director
- 23 shall provide written notice of such a finding, which shall be publicly
- 24 available, and direct implementation of remedial actions to:
- 25 (a) assure that sufficient and effective solicitation efforts to women
- 26 and minority owned business enterprises are being made by said agency;

- 1 (b) divide contract requirements, when economically feasible, into
- 2 quantities that will expand the participation of women and minority-
- 3 owned business enterprises;
- 4 (c) eliminate extended experience or capitalization requirements, when
- 5 programmatically and economically feasible, that will expand partic-
- 6 ipation by women and minority-owned business enterprises;
- 7 (d) identify specific proposed contracts as particularly attractive or
- 8 appropriate for participation by women and minority-owned business
- 9 enterprises with such identification to result from and be coupled with
- 10 the efforts of paragraphs (a), (b), and (c) of this subdivision; and
- 11 (e) upon a finding by the director that an agency has failed to take
- 12 affirmative measures to implement the remedial plan and to follow any of
- 13 the remedial actions set forth by the director, and in the absence of
- 14 any objective progress towards the agency's goals, require some or all
- 15 of the agency's procurement, for a specified period of time, be placed
- 16 under the direction and control of another agency or agencies.
- 17 § 8. Section 316-a of the executive law, as added by chapter 175 of
- 18 the laws of 2010, is amended to read as follows:
- 19 § 316-a. Prohibitions in contracts; violations. Every contracting
- 20 agency shall include a provision in its state contracts expressly
- 21 providing that any contractor who [willfully and intentionally] fails to
- 22 make a good faith effort to comply with the minority and women-owned
- 23 participation requirements of this article as set forth in such state
- 24 contract shall be liable to the contracting agency for liquidated or
- 25 other appropriate damages and shall provide for other appropriate reme-
- 26 dies on account of such breach. A contracting agency that elects to
- 27 proceed against a contractor for breach of contract as provided in this
- 28 section shall be precluded from seeking enforcement pursuant to section

- 1 three hundred sixteen of this article; provided however, that the
- 2 contracting agency shall include a summary of all enforcement actions
- 3 undertaken pursuant to this section in its annual report submitted
- 4 pursuant to [subdivision three of] section three hundred fifteen of this
- 5 article.
- § 9. Subdivision 6 of section 163 of the state finance law, as amended
- 7 by chapter 569 of the laws of 2015, is amended to read as follows:
- 8 6. Discretionary buying thresholds. Pursuant to guidelines established
- 9 by the state procurement council: the commissioner may purchase services
- 10 and commodities in an amount not exceeding eighty-five thousand dollars
- 11 without a formal competitive process; state agencies may purchase
- 12 services and commodities in an amount not exceeding fifty thousand
- 13 dollars without a formal competitive process; and state agencies may
- 14 purchase commodities or services from small business concerns or those
- 15 certified pursuant to articles fifteen-A and seventeen-B of the execu-
- 16 tive law, or commodities or technology that are recycled or remanufac-
- 17 tured, or commodities that are food, including milk and milk products,
- 18 grown, produced or harvested in New York state in an amount not exceed-
- 19 ing [two] four hundred thousand dollars without a formal competitive
- 20 process.
- 21 § 10. Subparagraph (i) of paragraph (b) of subdivision 3 of section
- 22 2879 of the public authorities law, as amended by chapter 174 of the
- 23 laws of 2010, is amended to read as follows:
- 24 (i) for the selection of such contractors on a competitive basis, and
- 25 provisions relating to the circumstances under which the board may by
- 26 resolution waive competition, including, notwithstanding any other
- 27 provision of law requiring competition, the purchase of goods or
- 28 services from small business concerns or those certified as minority or

- 1 women-owned business enterprises, or goods or technology that are recy-
- 2 cled or remanufactured, in an amount not to exceed [two] four hundred
- 3 thousand dollars without a formal competitive process;
- 4 § 11. Paragraph a of subdivision 3 of section 139-j of the state
- 5 finance law is amended by adding two new subparagraphs 10 and 11 to read
- 6 as follows:
- 7 (10) Complaints by minority-owned business enterprises or women-owned
- 8 business enterprises, certified as such by the division of minority and
- 9 women's business development, to the minority and women-owned business
- 10 enterprise statewide advocate concerning the procuring governmental
- 11 entity's failure to comply with the requirements of section three
- 12 hundred fifteen of the executive law;
- 13 (11) Communications between the minority and women-owned business
- 14 enterprise statewide advocate and the procuring governmental entity in
- 15 furtherance of an investigation of the minority and women-owned business
- 16 enterprise statewide advocate pursuant to section three hundred twelve-a
- 17 of the executive law;
- 18 § 12. Subdivision 6 of section 8 of the public buildings law, as
- 19 amended by chapter 840 of the laws of 1980, is amended to read as
- 20 follows:
- 21 6. All contracts for amounts in excess of five thousand dollars for
- 22 the work of construction, reconstruction, alteration, repair or improve-
- 23 ment of any state building, whether constructed or to be constructed
- 24 must be offered for public bidding and may be awarded to the lowest
- 25 responsible and reliable bidder, as will best promote the public inter-
- 26 est, by the said department or other agency with the approval of the
- 27 comptroller for the whole or any part of the work to be performed, and,
- 28 in the discretion of the said department or other agency, such contracts

may be sublet; provided, however, that no such contract shall be awarded to a bidder other than the lowest responsible and reliable bidder\_ except for certain contracts awarded to minority or women-owned business 3 enterprises as provided herein, without the written approval of the comptroller. When a proposal consists of unit prices of items specified to be performed, the lowest bid shall be deemed to be that which specifically states the lowest gross sum for which the entire work will be 7 performed, except for certain contracts awarded to minority or women-8 owned business enterprises as provided herein, including all the items 9 specified in the proposal thereof. The lowest bid shall be determined by 10 the commissioner of general services on the basis of the gross sum for 11 which the entire work will be performed, arrived at by a correct compu-12 tation of all the items specified in the proposal therefor at the unit 13 prices contained in the bid. Provided, however, that where a responsible 14 and reliable bidder certified as a minority-owned business enterprise or 15 women-owned business enterprise pursuant to article fifteen-A of the 16 executive law submits a bid of one million four hundred thousand dollars 17 or less, as adjusted annually for inflation beginning January first, two 18 thousand nineteen, the bid of the minority or women-owned business 19 enterprise shall be deemed the lowest bid unless it exceeds the bid of 20 any other bidder by more than ten percent. 21 § 13. The penal law is amended by adding a new article 181 to read as 22

24 ARTICLE 181

MINORITY OR WOMEN-OWNED BUSINESS ENTERPRISE FRAUD

26 Section 181.00 Definitions.

23

25

follows:

| 1 181,10 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the | 1 | 181.10 Minority | or women-owned | business | enterprise | fraud | in | the |
|---|---|-----------------|----------------|----------|------------|-------|----|-----|
|---|---|-----------------|----------------|----------|------------|-------|----|-----|

- 2 third degree.
- 3 181,20 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the
- 4 <u>second degree.</u>
- 5 181.30 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the
- 6 <u>first degree.</u>
- 7 § 181.00 Definitions.
- 8 1. "Minority-owned business enterprise" means a business enterprise
- 9 certified as such pursuant to article fifteen-A of the executive law.
- 10 2. "State contract" shall have the same meaning as in article
- 11 fifteen-A of the executive law.
- 12 3. "Women-owned business enterprise" means a business enterprise
- 13 certified as such pursuant to article fifteen-A of the executive law.
- 14 § 181.10 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the third
- 15 <u>degree</u>.
- 16 A person is guilty of minority or women-owned business enterprise
- 17 fraud in the third degree when he or she knowingly provides materially
- 18 false information or omits material information concerning the use or
- 19 identification of a minority or women-owned business enterprise for the
- 20 purpose of being awarded, or demonstrating compliance with the minority
- 21 and women-owned business participation requirements of, a state
- 22 <u>contract.</u>
- 23 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the third degree
- 24 is a class A misdemeanor.
- 25 <u>s 181.20 Minority or women owned business enterprise fraud in the second</u>
- 26 <u>degree</u>.
- 27 A person is quilty of minority or women-owned business enterprise
- 28 fraud in the second degree when he or she knowingly provides materially

- 1 false information or omits material information concerning the use or
- 2 identification of a minority or women-owned business enterprise for the
- 3 purpose of being awarded, or demonstrating compliance with the minority
- 4 and women-owned business participation requirements of, a state
- 5 contract, and the state contract is valued in excess of fifty thousand
- 6 dollars.
- 7 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the second degree
- 8 is a class E felony.
- 9 § 181.30 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the first
- 10 <u>degree</u>.
- 11 A person is guilty of minority or women-owned business enterprise
- 12 fraud in the first degree when he or she knowingly provides materially
- 13 false information or omits material information concerning the use or
- 14 identification of a minority or women-owned business enterprise for the
- 15 purpose of being awarded, or demonstrating compliance with the minority
- 16 and women-owned business participation requirements of, a state
- 17 contract, and the state contract is valued in excess of one million
- 18 dollars.
- 19 Minority or women-owned business enterprise fraud in the first degree
- 20 is a class D felony.
- 21 § 14. The opening paragraph of subdivision (h) of section 121 of chap-
- 22 ter 261 of the laws of 1988, amending the state finance law and other
- 23 laws relating to the New York state infrastructure trust fund, as
- 24 amended by section 1 of part CCC of chapter 59 of laws of 2017, is
- 25 amended to read as follows:
- 26 The provisions of sections sixty-two through sixty-six of this act
- 27 shall expire [April fifteenth, two thousand eighteen, provided, however,
- 28 that if the statewide disparity study regarding the participation of

- 1 minority and women-owned business enterprises in state contracts
- 2 required pursuant to subdivision one of section three hundred twelve-a
- 3 of the executive law is completed and delivered to the governor and the
- 4 legislature on or before June thirtieth, two thousand seventeen, then
- 5 the provisions of sections sixty-two through sixty-six of this act shall
- 6 expire] and be deemed repealed on December thirty-first, two thousand
- 7 [eighteen] twenty-three, except that:
- 8 § 15. The executive law is amended by adding a new article 28 as
- 9 follows:
- 10 ARTICLE 28
- 11 <u>WORKFORCE DIVERSITY PROGRAM</u>
- 12 Section 821. Definitions.
- 13 <u>822. Workforce participation goals.</u>
- 14 823. Reporting.
- 15 <u>824. Enforcement.</u>
- 16 <u>825. Powers and responsibilities of the division.</u>
- 17 <u>826. Severability.</u>
- 18 § 821. Definitions. As used in this article, the following terms shall
- 19 have the following meanings:
- 20 <u>1. "Contractor" shall mean an individual, a business enterprise,</u>
- 21 including a sole proprietorship, a partnership, a corporation, a not-
- 22 for-profit corporation, or any other party to a state contract, or a
- 23 bidder in conjunction with the award of a state contract or a proposed
- 24 party to a state contract.
- 25 <u>2. "Department" shall mean the department of labor.</u>

- 1 3. "Director" shall mean the director of the division of minority and
- 2 women's business development.
- 3 4. "Disparity study" shall mean the most recent study of disparities
- 4 between the utilization of minority group members and women in the
- 5 performance of state contracts and the availability of minority group
- 6 members and women to perform such work by the director pursuant to arti-
- 7 <u>cle fifteen-A of this chapter.</u>
- 8 5. "Division" shall mean the department of economic development's
- 9 division of minority and women's business development.
- 10 6. "List of non-compliant contractors" shall mean a list of contrac-
- 11 tors and subcontractors, maintained by the division and published on the
- 12 website of the division, that are ineligible to participate as contrac-
- 13 tors or subcontractors in the performance of state contracts for a term
- 14 determined by the director.
- 15 7. "Minority group member" shall mean a United States citizen or
- 16 permanent resident alien who is and can demonstrate membership in one of
- 17 the following groups:
- 18 (a) Black persons having origins in any of the Black African racial
- 19 groups;
- 20 (b) Hispanic persons of Mexican, Puerto Rican, Dominican, Cuban,
- 21 Central or South American of either Indian or Hispanic origin, regard-
- 22 <u>less of race;</u>
- 23 (c) Native American or Alaskan native persons having origins in any of
- 24 the original peoples of North America;
- 25 (d) Asian and Pacific Islander persons having origins in any of the
- 26 Far East countries, South East Asia, the Indian subcontinent or the
- 27 Pacific Islands.

- 1 8. "Non-compliant contractor" shall mean a contractor or subcontractor
- 2 that has failed to make a good faith effort to meet the workforce
- 3 participation goal established by a state agency on a state contract,
- 4 and has been listed by the division on its list of non-compliant
- 5 contractors.
- 6 9. "State agency" shall mean (a) (i) any state department, or (ii) any
- 7 division, board, commission or bureau of any state department, or (iii)
- 8 the state university of New York and the city university of New York,
- 9 including all their constituent units except community colleges and the
- 10 independent institutions operating statutory or contract colleges on
- 11 behalf of the state, or (iv) a board, a majority of whose members are
- 12 appointed by the governor or who serve by virtue of being state officers
- 13 or employees as defined in subparagraph (i), (ii) or (iii) of paragraph
- 14 (i) of subdivision one of section seventy-three of the public officers
- 15 <u>law.</u>
- 16 (b) a "state authority," as defined in subdivision one of section two
- 17 of the public authorities law, and the following:
- 18 Albany County Airport Authority;
- 19 Albany Port District Commission;
- 20 Alfred, Almond, Hornellsville Sewer Authority;
- 21 Battery Park City Authority;
- 22 Cayuga County Water and Sewer Authority;
- 23 (Nelson A. Rockefeller) Empire State Plaza Performing Arts Center
- 24 Corporation;
- 25 Industrial Exhibit Authority;
- 26 Livingston County Water and Sewer Authority;
- 27 Long Island Power Authority;
- 28 Long Island Rail Road;

- 1 Long Island Market Authority;
- 2 Manhattan and Bronx Surface Transit Operating Authority;
- 3 Metro-North Commuter Railroad;
- 4 Metropolitan Suburban Bus Authority;
- 5 Metropolitan Transportation Authority;
- 6 Natural Heritage Trust;
- 7 New York City Transit Authority;
- 8 New York Convention Center Operating Corporation;
- 9 New York State Bridge Authority;
- 10 New York State Olympic Regional Development Authority;
- 11 New York State Thruway Authority;
- 12 Niagara Falls Public Water Authority;
- 13 Niagara Falls Water Board;
- 14 Port of Oswego Authority;
- 15 Power Authority of the State of New York;
- 16 Roosevelt Island Operating Corporation;
- 17 Schenectady Metroplex Development Authority;
- 18 State Insurance Fund;
- 19 Staten Island Rapid Transit Operating Authority;
- 20 State University Construction Fund;
- 21 Syracuse Regional Airport Authority;
- 22 Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority;
- 23 Upper Mohawk valley regional water board;
- 24 Upper Mohawk valley regional water finance authority;
- 25 Upper Mohawk valley memorial auditorium authority;
- 26 Urban Development Corporation and its subsidiary corporations.

- 1 (c) the following only to the extent of state contracts entered into for
- 2 its own account or for the benefit of a state agency as defined in para-
- 3 graph (a) or (b) of this subdivision:
- 4 Dormitory Authority of the State of New York;
- 5 Facilities Development Corporation;
- 6 New York State Energy Research and Development Authority;
- 7 New York State Science and Technology Foundation.
- 8 10. "State contract" shall mean: (a) a written agreement or purchase
- 9 order instrument, providing for a total expenditure in excess of fifty
- 10 thousand dollars, whereby a state agency is committed to expend or does
- 11 expend or grant funds in return for labor, services including but not
- 12 limited to legal, financial and other professional services, supplies,
- 13 equipment, materials or any combination of the foregoing, to be
- 14 performed on behalf of, for, or rendered or furnished to the state agen-
- 15 cy; (b) a written agreement in excess of two hundred thousand dollars
- 16 whereby a state agency is committed to expend or does expend or grant
- 17 funds for the acquisition, construction, demolition, replacement, major
- 18 repair or renovation of real property and improvements thereon; and (c)
- 19 a written agreement in excess of two hundred thousand dollars whereby
- 20 the owner of a state assisted housing project is committed to expend or
- 21 does expend funds for the acquisition, construction, demolition,
- 22 replacement, major repair or renovation of real property and improve-
- 23 ments thereon for such project.
- 24 11. "Subcontractor" shall mean any individual or business enterprise
- 25 that provides goods or services to any individual or business for use in
- 26 the performance of a state contract, whether or not such goods or
- 27 services are provided to a party to a state contract.

- 1 § 822. Workforce participation goals. 1. The director, in consulta-
- 2 tion with the department, shall develop aspirational goals for the
- 3 utilization of minority group members and women in construction trade,
- 4 profession, and occupation.
- 5 (a) Aspirational goals for the utilization of minority group members
- 6 and women must set forth the expected participation of minority group
- 7 members and women in each construction trade, profession, and occupa-
- 8 tion, and shall be expressed as a percentage of the total hours of work
- 9 to be performed by each trade, profession, and occupation based on the
- 10 availability of minority group members and women within each trade,
- 11 profession, and occupation.
- 12 (i) The aspirational goals shall set forth separate levels of expected
- 13 participation by men and women for each minority group, and for Cauca-
- 14 sian women, in each construction trade, profession, and occupation.
- 15 (ii) Aspirational goals for the expected participation of minority
- 16 group members and women shall be established for each county of the
- 17 state. The director may establish aspirational goals for the expected
- 18 participation of minority group members and women for municipalities
- 19 where the director deems feasible and appropriate.
- 20 (iii) The director shall, in establishing the aspirational goals,
- 21 consider the findings of the most recent disparity study and any rele-
- 22 vant data published by the United States Census Bureau.
- 23 (b) The director shall update the aspirational goals on a periodic
- 24 basis, no less than annually.
- 25 2. State agencies shall, for each invitation for bids, request for
- 26 proposals, or other solicitation that will result in the award of a
- 27 state contract, set forth the expected degree of workforce participation
- 28 by minority group members and women.

- 1 (a) Each workforce participation goal established by a state agency
- 2 shall set forth the expected level of participation by minority group
- 3 members and women in the performance of each trade, profession, and
- 4 occupation required in the performance of the contract.
- 5 (b) Goals for the participation of minority group members and women
- 6 shall set forth separate goals for each of the following groups in each
- 7 trade, profession, and occupation:
- 8 (i) Black men;
- 9 (ii) Black women;
- 10 (iii) Hispanic men;
- 11 (iv) Hispanic women;
- 12 (v) Native American men;
- 13 (vi) Native American women;
- 14 (vii) Asian men;
- 15 (viii) Asian women;
- 16 (ix) Caucasian women.
- 17 (c) In establishing workforce participation goals, state agencies
- 18 shall consider factors including, but not limited to:
- 19 (i) the findings of the disparity study;
- 20 (ii) any relevant data published by the United States Census Bureau;
- 21 and
- 22 (iii) if applicable, any aspirational goal established by the divi-
- 23 sion.
- 24 (d) In any case where a state agency establishes a workforce partic-
- 25 ipation goal on an invitation for bids, request for proposals, or other
- 26 solicitation that will result in the award of a state contract for
- 27 construction that deviates from the aspirational goal for construction
- 28 work in the county or municipality in which the work will be performed,

- 1 the state agency shall document numerical evidence demonstrating that
- 2 the application of the aspirational goal would not be practical, feasi-
- 3 ble, or appropriate.
- 4 3. Every contractor responding to an invitation for bids, request for
- 5 proposals, or other solicitation that will result in the award of a
- 6 state contract subject to workforce participation goals pursuant to this
- 7 section shall agree to make a good faith effort to achieve such work-
- 8 force participation goal or request a waiver of such goal.
- 9 (a) A contractor that certifies that it will make a good faith effort
- 10 to achieve a workforce participation goal shall provide with its
- 11 response to the applicable invitation for bids, request for proposals,
- 12 or other solicitation:
- 13 (i) A certification stating that the contractor will make a good faith
- 14 effort to achieve the applicable workforce participation goal and will
- 15 contractually require any subcontractors to the contractor to make a
- 16 good faith effort to achieve the applicable workforce participation goal
- 17 in any subcontracted work, which certification shall acknowledge that
- 18 failure by the contractor or any of its subcontractors to make a good
- 19 faith effort to achieve the applicable workforce participation goal may
- 20 result in a determination by the contracting state agency that the
- 21 contractor or its subcontractor is a non-compliant contractor;
- 22 (ii) The level of anticipated participation by minority group members
- 23 and women as employees to the contractor, or, if the state agency has
- 24 specifically indicated that such documentation is not required as part
- 25 of the response to the invitation for bids, request for proposals, or
- 26 other solicitation, a date certain for the submission of such documenta.
- 27 tion after the award of the state contract;

- 1 (iii) A list of all subcontractors anticipated to perform work on the
- 2 state contract and the level of anticipated participation by minority
- 3 group members and women as employees to each subcontractor, or, if the
- 4 state agency has specifically indicated that such documentation is not
- 5 required as part of the response to the invitation for bids, request for
- 6 proposals, or other solicitation, a date certain for the submission of
- 7 such documentation after the award of the state contract; and
- 8 (iv) Such other information as the contracting state agency shall
- 9 require.
- 10 (b) A contractor that requests a waiver of a workforce participation
- 11 goal shall provide with its response to the applicable invitation for
- 12 bids, request for proposals, or other solicitation:
- 13 (i) Numerical evidence setting forth why the achievement of the work-
- 14 force participation qoal is not practical, feasible, or appropriate in
- 15 light of the trades, professions, and occupations required to perform
- 16 the work of the state contract;
- 17 (ii) Documentation of the contractor's efforts, and any efforts by
- 18 subcontractors to the contractor, to promote the inclusion of minority
- 19 group members and women in trades, professions, and occupations required
- 20 in the performance of the state contract;
- 21 (iii) The maximum feasible level of participation by minority group
- 22 members and women in each of the trades, professions, and occupations
- 23 required in the performance of the work of the state contract;
- 24 (iv) The level of anticipated participation by minority group members
- 25 and women as employees to the contractor;
- 26 (v) A list of all subcontractors anticipated to perform work on the
- 27 state contract and the level of anticipated participation by minority
- 28 group members and women as employees to each subcontractor; and

- 1 (vi) Any other relevant information evidencing that the contractor's
- 2 achievement of the workforce participation goal would not be practical,
- 3 feasible, or appropriate.
- 4 4. A state agency shall not award a state contract to a contractor
- 5 unless the contractor has (i) certified that it will make a good faith
- 6 effort to achieve the applicable workforce participation goal and
- 7 provided documentation of the workforce anticipated to perform the work
- 8 of the state contract or (ii) submitted a waiver request which the state
- 9 agency deems to reflect the maximum feasible participation of minority
- 10 group members and women in each of the trades, professions, and occupa-
- 11 tions required in performance of the work of the state contract.
- 12 (a) In the event that a contractor submits a certification or waiver
- 13 request that is accepted by the state agency, the state agency shall
- 14 establish in the state contract the expected level of participation by
- 15 minority group members and women in each of the trades, professions, and
- 16 occupations required in performance of the work of the state contract,
- 17 require that the contractor make good faith efforts to achieve such
- 18 workforce participation goals, require that the contractor require any
- 19 subcontractors to make a good faith effort to achieve the applicable
- 20 workforce participation goal in any subcontracted work, and indicate
- 21 that the failure of the contractor or any of its subcontractors to make
- 22 a good faith effort to achieve the workforce participation goal may
- 23 result in the contractor or subcontractor being deemed a non-compliant
- 24 contractor.
- 25 (b) In the event that a contractor fails to submit a certification,
- 26 waiver request, or any other information required by the state agency,
- 27 or the state agency determines that a contractor's waiver request does
- 28 not demonstrate that the applicable workforce participation goal is

- 1 impractical, unfeasible, or inappropriate, the state agency shall notify
- 2 the contractor of the deficiency in writing and provide the contractor
- 3 five business days to remedy the noticed deficiency. A state agency
- 4 shall reject any bid or proposal of a contractor that fails to timely
- 5 respond to a notice of deficiency or to provide documentation remedying
- 6 the deficiency to the satisfaction of the state agency.
- 7 (i) Where failure to remedy any notified deficiency in the workforce
- 8 utilization plan is a ground for disqualification, that issue and all
- 9 other grounds for disqualification shall be stated in writing by the
- 10 contracting state agency. The contractor shall be entitled to an admin-
- 11 istrative hearing, on a record, involving all grounds stated by the
- 12 contracting state agency in its notice of the contractor's disqualifica-
- 13 tion. Such hearing shall be conducted by the appropriate authority of
- 14 the contracting agency to review the determination of disqualification.
- 15 A final administrative determination made following such hearing shall
- 16 be reviewable in a proceeding commenced under article seventy-eight of
- 17 the civil practice law and rules, provided that such proceeding is
- 18 commenced within thirty days of the notice given by certified mail
- 19 return receipt requested rendering such final administrative determi-
- 20 nation. Such proceeding shall be commenced in the supreme court, appel-
- 21 late division, third department and such proceeding shall be preferred
- 22 over all other civil causes except election causes, and shall be heard
- 23 and determined in preference to all other civil business pending there-
- 24 in, except election matters, irrespective of position on the calendar.
- 25 Appeals taken to the court of appeals of the state of New York shall be
- 26 subject to the same preference.
- 27 § 823. Reporting. 1. State contracts shall require contractors to
- 28 submit, and to require any subcontractors to submit, to the contracting

- 1 state agency reports documenting the hours worked by employees of the
- 2 contractor and any subcontractors in the performance of the work of the
- 3 state contract. Such reports shall be submitted no less frequently than
- 4 monthly for state contracts for construction and quarterly for all other
- 5 state contracts. Such reports shall identify the race, ethnicity,
- 6 gender, and trade, profession, or occupation of each employee performing
- 7 work on a state contract.
- 8 2. State agencies shall submit periodic reports to the director, or
- 9 the designee of the director, concerning the participation of minority
- 10 group members and women in state contracts let by such agencies and such
- 11 state agencies' compliance with this article. Such reports shall be
- 12 submitted at such time, and include such information, as the director
- 13 shall require in regulations. State agencies shall make available their
- 14 facilities, books, and records for inspection, upon reasonable notice,
- 15 by the director or the director's designee.
- 16 3. The department shall provide such assistance as the director shall
- 17 require in carrying out the requirements of this section.
- 18 § 824. Enforcement. 1. Where it appears that a contractor cannot,
- 19 after a good faith effort, meet the workforce participation goals set
- 20 forth in a particular state contract, a contractor may file a written
- 21 application with the contracting state agency requesting a partial or
- 22 total waiver of such requirements. Such request shall set forth the
- 23 reasons for such contractor's inability to meet the workforce partic-
- 24 ipation goal, specifically describe the reasons for any deviations from
- 25 the anticipated workforce participation set forth in the contractor's
- 26 bid or proposal leading to the award of the state contract, and describe
- 27 the efforts by the contractor and any subcontractors to achieve the
- 28 maximum feasible participation of minority group members and women in

- 1 the performance of the work of the state contract. Where the contrac-
- 2 tor's inability to achieve the workforce participation goal on a state
- 3 contract is attributable to the failure of one or more subcontractors to
- 4 make good faith efforts to achieve the maximum feasible participation of
- 5 minority group members and women in the performance of the work of the
- 6 state contract, the contractor shall identify such subcontractor or
- 7 subcontractors to the contracting state agency.
- 8 2. A state agency shall grant a request for a waiver of workforce
- 9 participation goals on a state contract where:
- 10 (a) The contractor demonstrates that the contractor and its subcon-
- 11 tractors made good faith efforts to achieve the workforce participation
- 12 goal on the state contract, and that insufficient minority group members
- 13 or women were available in the trades, professions, and occupations
- 14 required to perform the work of the state contract; or,
- 15 (b) The contractor contractually required each of its subcontractors
- 16 to make a good faith effort to achieve the maximum feasible partic-
- 17 ipation of minority group members and women in the performance of the
- 18 subcontracted work, periodically monitored such subcontractors' deploy-
- 19 ment of minority group members and women in the performance of the
- 20 subcontracted work, provided notice to such subcontractors of any defi-
- 21 ciencies in their deployment of minority group members and women in the
- 22 performance of such subcontracted work, and could not achieve the work-
- 23 force participation goal for one or more trades, professions, or occupa-
- 24 tions without the good faith efforts of such subcontractors.
- 25 3. Where a state agency denies a contractor's request for a waiver of
- 26 workforce participation goals pursuant to this section, the state agency
- 27 shall recommend to the director and the department that the contractor
- 28 be deemed a non-compliant contractor.

- 1 4. Where a state agency grants a request for a waiver of workforce
- 2 participation goals pursuant to this section based on one or more
- 3 subcontractors' failure to make good faith efforts to achieve the maxi-
- 4 mum feasible participation of minority group members and women in the
- 5 performance of the subcontracted work, the state agency shall recommend
- 6 to the director and the department that the subcontractor be deemed a
- 7 non-compliant contractor.
- 8 5. Upon receipt of a recommendation from a state agency that a
- 9 contractor or subcontractor should be deemed a non-compliant contractor,
- 10 the director shall, with the assistance of the department, review the
- 11 facts and circumstances forming the basis of the recommendation and
- 12 issue a determination as to whether or not the contractor or subcontrac-
- 13 tor should be deemed a non-compliant contractor and, if so, the duration
- 14 of such status as a non-compliant contractor. In determining the dura-
- 15 tion of a contractor's or subcontractor's status as a non-compliant
- 16 contractor, the director shall consider:
- 17 (i) whether the contractor or subcontractor has previously been deemed
- 18 a non-compliant contractor;
- 19 (ii) the number of hours of expected participation by minority group
- 20 members and women lost as a result of the contractor's or subcontrac-
- 21 tor's failure to make good faith efforts to include minority group
- 22 members or women in the performance of one or more state contracts; and
- 23 (iii) whether the contractor or subcontractor has offered to provide
- 24 employment opportunities, training, or other remedial benefits to minor-
- 25 ity group members or women in relevant trades, professions, or occupa-
- 26 tions.
- 27 6. A contractor or subcontractor deemed a non-compliant contractor by
- 28 the director may request an administrative hearing before an independent

- 1 hearing officer to appeal the determination of the director. The deci-
- 2 sion of the hearing officer shall be final and may only be vacated or
- 3 modified as provided in article seventy-eight of the civil practice law
- 4 and rules upon an application made within the time provided by such
- 5 <u>article.</u>
- 6 7. Upon a final determination that a contractor or subcontractor is a
- 7 non-compliant contractor, the director shall list the contractor or
- 8 subcontractor as such on its website and indicate the term of such
- 9 contractor's or subcontractor's status as a non-compliant contractor. A
- 10 non-compliant contractor shall be ineligible to participate as a
- 11 contractor or subcontractor on any state contract.
- 12 § 825. Powers and responsibilities of the division. 1. The director
- 13 shall post to the website of the division on or before April first of
- 14 each year the aspirational goals for the utilization of minority group
- 15 members and women in construction required pursuant to section eight
- 16 hundred twenty-two of this article.
- 17 2. The director shall promulgate rules and regulations for the imple-
- 18 mentation of this article, including, but not limited to, procedures for
- 19 the submission of certifications and workforce utilization plans by
- 20 contractors, criteria for granting waivers of workforce participation
- 21 goals, and the contents of reports by state agencies concerning their
- 22 implementation of the requirements of this article.
- 23 3. The division shall, from time to time, review the facilities,
- 24 books, and records of state agencies to ascertain the accuracy of their
- 25 reports and their compliance with the requirements of this article. The
- 26 department shall provide such assistance as the director shall require
- 27 in carrying out the requirements of this section.

- 1 § 826. Severability. If any clause, sentence, paragraph, section or
- 2 part of this article shall be adjudged by any court of competent juris-
- 3 diction to be invalid, the judgment shall not affect, impair or invali-
- 4 date the remainder thereof, but shall be confined in its operation to
- 5 the clause, sentence, paragraph, section or part of this article direct-
- 6 ly involved in the controversy in which the judgment shall have been
- 7 rendered.
- § 16. This act shall take effect on April 1, 2018; provided, however,
- 9 that
- 10 (a) the amendments to article 15-A of the executive law, made by
- 11 sections one, two, three, four, five, six, seven and eight of this act,
- 12 shall not affect the expiration and repeal of such article and shall
- 13 expire and be deemed repealed therewith;
- 14 (b) the amendments to section 163 of the state finance law, made by
- 15 section nine of this act, shall not affect the expiration and repeal of
- 16 such section, and shall expire and be deemed repealed therewith;
- 17 (c) the amendments to section 139-j of the state finance law, made by
- 18 section eleven of this act, shall not affect the expiration and repeal
- 19 of such section, and shall expire and be deemed repealed therewith; and
- 20 (d) section fifteen of this act shall expire and be deemed repealed
- 21 December 31, 2023.

22 PART R

- 23 Section 1. Paragraph (i) of subdivision (a) of section 2 of part F of
- 24 chapter 60 of the laws of 2015, constituting the infrastructure invest-
- 25 ment act, as amended by section 1 of part RRR of chapter 59 of the laws
- 26 of 2017, is amended to read as follows: