Welcome to Our Webinar!

Gregory D. Zimet, Ph.D.
Understanding and Talking with Vaccine-Hesitant Patients

Gregory D. Zimet, Ph.D.
Professor of Pediatrics and Clinical Psychology
Division of Adolescent Medicine
Indiana University School of Medicine

INDIANA UNIVERSITY
Disclosures

- No conflicts over the past year with respect to private industry
- I am an investigator on NIH-funded grants related to HPV vaccination
Historically, implementing effective immunization policy has been a challenge.
Edward Jenner (pioneer of the smallpox vaccine) and his two colleagues seeing off three anti-vaccination opponents; the dead are littered at their feet. 1808.
The following dialogues were adapted from:

Dubovsky & Weissberg, “Clinical Psychiatry in Primary Care” (1986) &
Ed Marcuse (http://ocw.uci.edu/courses/course.aspx?id=60)

Also see:
www2.aap.org/cisp/pediatricians/riskcommunicationvideos.html
An unsuccessful approach to communicating with patients

You are due for your annual flu vaccine today.

I’m not interested in getting the flu vaccine. A friend of mine got the flu from it last year.

You have nothing to worry about. We know the vaccine can’t cause the flu.

Well, I’ve seen research on the internet about the flu vaccine. They said it wasn’t safe and had mercury in it.

You can’t trust those websites. Good scientific research shows that flu vaccines are completely safe.

I still feel uncomfortable about this vaccine.

Well, but how would you feel if your granddaughter caught the flu from you and got really sick?

I don’t think that’s fair, and anyway, she’s very healthy.

It’s just really important that you get this today, okay?.

It’s my health and I’ll make that decision!

- Directing style
- “Righting reflex”
- Failing to take cues
- Jargon
- Discrediting information source
- Overstating vaccine safety
- Confrontation
- Emotional manipulation/coercion
You are due for your annual flu vaccine today.

You have nothing to worry about. We know the vaccine can’t cause the flu.

You can’t trust those websites. Good scientific research shows that flu vaccines are completely safe.

Well, I’ve seen research on the internet about the flu vaccine. They said it wasn’t safe and had mercury in it.

I still feel uncomfortable about this vaccine.

Well, but how would you feel if your granddaughter caught the flu from you and got really sick?

It’s just really important that you get this today, okay?

I’m not interested in getting the flu vaccine. A friend of mine got the flu from it last year.

I don’t think that’s fair, and anyway, she’s very healthy.

It’s my health and I’ll make that decision!
An more successful approach to communicating with patients

You are due for your annual flu vaccine today.

What concerns do you have?

I’m not interested in getting the flu vaccine. A friend of mine got the flu from it last year.

Well, I’ve seen research on the internet about the flu vaccine. They said it wasn’t safe and had mercury in it.

From what I’ve seen on TV, I’m not sure I can trust the ingredients in vaccines. Science isn’t always right.

Can we take some time to talk about your questions about vaccine ingredients? Then, if you would like, I can give you some trustworthy information sources about vaccines.

OK. That sounds fair.

Helpful

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guiding style</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care with body language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eliciting concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asking permission to discuss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledging/listening/empathy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Determining readiness for change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informing about benefits and risks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Giving appropriate resources</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I understand that you want to do what is best for you; so do I. Many people feel bombarded with conflicting information and do not know whom to believe.
An more successful approach to communicating with patients

You are due for your annual flu vaccine today.

You have concerns do you have?

I'm not interested in getting the flu vaccine. A friend of mine got the flu from it last year.

Well, I’ve seen research on the internet about the flu vaccine. They said it wasn’t safe and had mercury in it.

From what I’ve seen on TV, I’m not sure I can trust the ingredients in vaccines. Science isn’t always right.

OK. That sounds fair.

Helpful

- Guiding style
- Care with body language
- Eliciting concerns
- Asking permission to discuss
- Acknowledging/listening/empathy
- Determining readiness for change
- Informing about benefits and risks
- Giving appropriate resources

I understand that you want to do what is best for you; so do I. Many people feel bombarded with conflicting information and do not know whom to believe.

Can we take some time to talk about your concerns about vaccine ingredients? Then, if you would like, I can give you some trustworthy information about vaccines.
Variations in Vaccination Attitudes
All worried patients are not alike

- Patients worried about vaccines in general
- Patients worried about specific vaccines (e.g., flu or HPV)
- Patients who attribute medical or development problems to past vaccination
Concerned parents are not all alike

- Differ on vaccine behavior: Up-to-date, delaying, non-immunized

- Studies find differentiation in concerns and beliefs
  - Very worried
  - Fence-sitter
  - Fleeting concern
  - Vaccine-confident

Leask et al., BMC Pediatrics 2012;
Keane et al., Vaccine 2005;
Gust et al., Am J Health Behav 2005
Health Care Provider (HCP) – Patient Communication
Patients want to talk to their HCPs:

- HCP is most used source of information about immunization and most trusted source
- But, patients report problems with:
  - Content of discussions
  - Communication/interaction

Gellin et al., 2000; Gust et al., 2008; Davis et al., 2001
HCP and patient may approach decision in very different ways:

- Different internal models of
  - Decision-making
  - How “risk” is experienced

- These models or cultures sometimes collide

- HCP-parent relationship is a possible bridge across the two cultures
What does the HCP bring?

- **HCP model of decision-making**
  - Biomedical, focuses on scientific research about risks and benefits
  - Risk is communicated numerically
  - Decisions based on weighing consequences of possible choice alternatives

Hobson-West, Health Risk Soc 2003
What does the patient bring?

- Patient model of decision-making
  - Biomedical model of health and disease and/or...homeopathic model
  - More feeling-based
  - Factors in decision may include non-scientific, affect-driven issues (e.g., omission bias)

Sturm et al. J Dev Behav Pediatr 2005
Risk-as-feelings

- “To a lay person, risky events are ones that trigger worry, dread, or regret…”
- Risk may be experienced as “some versus none”
- A patient’s emotional reaction may strongly influence decisions

Loewenstein et al. Psychol Bull 2001;
Slovic et al., Risk Analysis 2004;
Chapman & Coups. Health Psychol 2006
Fear and trust

- “It is hard to unscare someone” (Offit)
  - “Trust comes on foot but leaves on horseback” (Casiday, Soc Sci Med 2007)

- Degree of trust/mistrust in HCP may reflect trust in...
  - Government
  - Medicine and medical policy-making organizations
  - The “business of science”
  - Pharmaceuticals

Hobsen-West, Health Risk Soc 2003
A word about perceived causation:

“Some argue, plausibly, that we evolved to see a single cause even where there is none, on the basis that it is better to be safe than sorry, better to identify that pattern in the trees as a tiger, better to run--far better-- than to assume that what we see is a “chance” effect of scattered light and shifting leaves in the breeze, creating an illusion of stripes.”

Blastland & Dilnot, “The Numbers Game” 2009
What Can Help
Expression of Anti-Vaccine Sentiments or Hesitancy about Vaccination…

- Can provoke frustration and anger in the provider, which can lead to:
  - Rigid refusal to be “manipulated”
  - Overcompensating: “giving in” to patient’s demands
  - Avoidance of the patient; disengagement
What can help:
Take concerns seriously

• Consider the patient as an individual
• Blanket statements of certainty/reassurance may feel like “brushoff”
• HCPs should spend the time needed to thoroughly understand patients’ concerns
  • Pre-screen for concerns while in waiting room
  • Schedule back for longer visit
  • Have staff person on call to address concerns

Benin et al., Pediatrics 2006
What can help:

Accurate info is necessary, but not sufficient

- Don’t assume patients understand vaccine mechanisms, immunity and herd immunity
  - Widespread lack of understanding
  - Personalized assessment of “vulnerabilities” may guide decision

- Scientific information reassures HCPs but not all patients

What can help: Support comprehension

- Help patients understand biomedical model of risk
  - Use natural frequencies
  - Avoid percentages
  - Avoid verbal probabilities (e.g., rare, likely, often)

Wroe et al., Health Psychol 2004
What can help:
Support understanding

• Use visual representations to help comprehension
  • One red dot in a field of 10,000 black dots
  • Arrays of stick figures, bar graphs
  • Graphic organizers alongside text

Kaplan et al., J Soc Behav Pers 1985;
Kools et al., Pat Educ Counseling 2007;
Blastland & Dilnot, “The Numbers Game” 2009
Visual depiction of probabilities
Some Facts About Cervical Cancer and the HPV Vaccine:

Girls who get the HPV vaccine are much less likely to get cervical cancer later in life.
Right now, there are 12 million American girls between the ages 11 and 16.

If NONE of these girls get the HPV vaccine, about 87,000 will get cervical cancer later in life. That's enough to fill a football stadium.

If ALL girls get the HPV vaccine, only about 27,000 will get cervical cancer. So the HPV vaccine would save 60,000 girls from getting cancer later in life.

NO HPV VACCINE

87,000
GET CANCER

WITH HPV VACCINE

60,000
SAVED
27,000 GET CANCER

**Some Facts About Cervical Cancer and the HPV Vaccine:**

Girls who get the HPV vaccine are much less likely to get cervical cancer later in life.

Right now, there are 12 million American girls between the ages 11 and 16.

If **NONE** of these girls get the HPV vaccine, about 87,000 will get cervical cancer later in life. That's enough to fill a football stadium.

**NO HPV VACCINE**

87,000 GET CANCER

If **ALL** girls get the HPV vaccine, only about 27,000 will get cervical cancer. So the HPV vaccine would save 60,000 girls from getting cancer later in life.

**WITH HPV VACCINE**

60,000 SAVED

27,000 GET CANCER

Safety information:

Compare to everyday experiences

Community Immunity Simulations


- [http://fred.publichealth.pitt.edu/proj/measles/](http://fred.publichealth.pitt.edu/proj/measles/)
More communication tips
What can help:
Communication tips

• Start with a presumptive recommendation, but be aware that:

• Strong persuasive techniques can be counterproductive and erode trust
  • Patients may focus on evidence that strengthens previously held views and discount evidence that does fit with view
  • Be cautious in use of hypothetical situations that force patients into a rhetorical corner:
    • “how would you feel if.... “

Betsch & Sachse, Health Psychol 2013;
Sturm et al. Zero to Three 2010;
Leask, NSW Pub Health Bull 2009
What can help: Communication tips

• How you provide information is as important as what you say
  • Avoid “scientific ping-pong”
  • Consider patient’s readiness for change
  • Use strategies from motivational interviewing (Leask et al., BMC Ped 2012)
  • Chunking and checking (Leask et al., BMC Ped 2012)
  • Decision aids may be useful tools for particularly resistant parents
Familiarize yourself with:

• ... what patients read
• ... what patients watch
• ... what websites patients access
• ... what social media patients participate in

What can help:
Know the current media coverage*

*Betsch et al. Vaccine 2012.
Summary

- Majority of patients do not require intensive intervention around vaccination
- For vaccine-hesitant patients, it is important to develop a decision-making partnership
  - Being an informed decision-maker is important to many patients
  - Reflects shift from paternalistic model to shared model of decision-making
  - Helps empower patients to make informed decision
Video

- https://www.youtube.com/watch?time_continue=1&v=ol1gnSaD_u8

- The above YouTube link contains four segments (accepting parent, mildly hesitant parent, moderately hesitant parent and very hesitant parent). The moderately hesitant segment was played during the webinar.
Resources

- Skills checklist for vaccine administration:

- Resources on adolescent vaccination, including the video just shown:

- Resources on adult immunization
  - [http://www.vaccineinformation.org/adults/resources.asp](http://www.vaccineinformation.org/adults/resources.asp)
Thank you for attending our webinar today. Please take a few moments to fill out a brief evaluation that will help us improve our educational offerings in the future. You can find a link to the survey in the chat box.