

May 16, 2017

To: Interested Parties

From: MB Public Affairs, Inc.

Re: ALRB/Aceron Case Costs

We sent a Public Records Act request to ALRB dated January 31, 2017 (copy attached) that, among other items, asked for the following information:

3. Correspondence from January 1, 2012 to present sent to/received from the California Department of Justice or California Attorney General pertaining to a request by ALRB to retain outside legal counsel or third parties to conduct any internal investigation initiated by or at the request of the ALRB.
4. Detailed list of expenditures/costs incurred by ALRB pertaining to the litigation and settlement of *Aceron v. ALRB* (#34-2014-00168939). This request includes, but is not limited to, settlement amounts paid to Aceron, legal fees paid to Aceron and/or his counsel, payments made to expert witnesses or other outside vendors retained by ALRB (please also identify any such expert witnesses or outside vendors by name), budget expenditures made or attributed to the California Department of Justice for representation, billing summaries or timesheets maintained by ALRB staff, billing summaries or timesheets maintained by DOJ staff relative to the *Aceron* case, travel costs, and court fees, among other items.
5. Detailed list of expenditures/costs incurred by or expected to be incurred by ALRB pertaining to the litigation and settlement of *Alvarez v. ALRB* (#34-2015-00185535). This request includes, but is not limited to, settlement amounts paid to Alvarez, legal fees paid to Alvarez and/or his counsel, payments made to expert witnesses or other outside vendors retained by ALRB (please also identify any such expert witnesses or outside vendors by name), budget expenditures made or attributed to the California Department of Justice for representation, billing summaries or timesheets maintained by ALRB staff, billing summaries or timesheets maintained by DOJ staff relative to the *Alvarez* case, travel costs, and court fees, among other items.

As part of their ongoing production of documents responsive to our Public Records Act request, ALRB sent a letter dated May 11, 2017 (copy attached) and 73 pages of documents (copy attached) that pertain to items #3, #4, and #5 specified above. A review of these 73 pages of documents shows that all but the first few pages pertain to costs incurred by ALRB relative to the *Aceron* case. (Note that it is possible – and likely – that ALRB may produce additional documents in a subsequent communication to us that show more costs for this case.)

The following table provides a summary of the \$662,725.98 in costs associated with the *Aceron v. ALRB* case based upon the documents received to date from ALRB. As shown in the table, the costs break down into several district categories: the settlement award to Aceron, costs for legal services provided by the California Department of Justice, and vendor costs.

SUMMARY OF ACERON V. ALRB COSTS

Category of Costs	Aggregate Amount
Settlement Award	\$525,000.00
DOJ Attorney Costs	\$111,477.50
DOJ Paralegal Costs	\$12,960.00
Vendor Costs	\$13,288.48
Total	\$662,725.98

Source: Documents Provided by ALRB

The following table provides a detailed, month-by-month accounting of the \$662,725.98 in costs associated with the *Aceron v. ALRB* case based upon the documents received to date from ALRB.

DETAIL OF ACERON V. ALRB COSTS

Description of Costs	Date/Time Period	Settlement Award	DOJ Attorney Costs	DOJ Paralegal Costs	Vendor Costs
DOJ Attorney Costs (0.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	12/31/2016		\$85.00		
DOJ Attorney Costs (2.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	9/30/2016		\$425.00		
Adr Services, Inc.	8/31/2016				\$7,890.95
DOJ Attorney Costs (4.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	8/31/2016		\$765.00		
DOJ Attorney Costs (1.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	7/31/2016		\$255.00		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (0.25 hours @ \$120/hour)	7/31/2016			\$30.00	
Greenberg & Weinmann – Aceron Settlement	6/30/2016	\$525,000.00			
DOJ Attorney Costs (46.25 hours @ \$170/hour)	6/30/2016		\$7,862.50		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (5.50 hours @ \$120/hour)	6/30/2016			\$660.00	
Veritext	6/30/2016				\$1,735.15
DOJ Attorney Costs (85.00 hours @ \$170/hour)	5/31/2016		\$14,450.00		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (1.50 hours @ \$120/hour)	5/31/2016			\$180.00	
Veritext/Barkley Court Reporters	4/30/2016				\$3,662.38
DOJ Attorney Costs (70.25 hours @ \$170/hour)	4/30/2016		\$11,942.50		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (8.25 hours @ \$120/hour)	4/30/2016			\$990.00	
DOJ Attorney Costs (70.75 hours @ \$170/hour)	3/31/2016		\$12,027.50		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (3.75 hours @ \$120/hour)	3/31/2016			\$450.00	
DOJ Attorney Costs (58.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	2/28/2016		\$9,945.00		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (53.25 hours @ \$120/hour)	2/28/2016			\$6,390.00	
DOJ Attorney Costs (61.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	1/31/2016		\$10,455.00		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (15.00 hours @ \$120/hour)	1/31/2016			\$1,800.00	
DOJ Attorney Costs (44.00 hours @ \$170/hour)	12/31/2015		\$7,480.00		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (7.75 hours @ \$120/hour)	12/31/2015			\$930.00	
DOJ Attorney Costs (46.50 hours @ \$170/hour)	11/30/2015		\$7,905.00		
DOJ Attorney Costs (164.00 hours @ \$170/hour)	* 7/1/15 - 10/31/15		\$27,880.00		
DOJ Paralegal Costs (12.75 hours @ \$120/hour)	* 7/1/15 - 10/31/15			\$1,530.00	
TOTALS		\$525,000.00	\$111,477.50	\$12,960.00	\$13,288.48

*Source: Documents Provided by ALRB; * Note: The “Summary of Legal Services” document provided by ALRB for the period ending November 30, 2015 shows DOJ Attorney and Paralegal hours provided during prior months in the fiscal year beginning July 1, 2015. ALRB, however, has not yet provided copies of those monthly “Summary of Legal Services” documents.*